### **AGENDA**

### **COMMITTEE ON AUDIT**

Meeting: 1:30 p.m., Tuesday, September 8, 2015

Glenn S. Dumke Auditorium

Lupe C. Garcia, Chair Douglas Faigin, Vice Chair

Adam Day Hugo N. Morales Peter J. Taylor

### **Consent Items**

Approval of Minutes of Meeting of July 21, 2015

### **Discussion Items**

1. Status Report on Current and Follow-up Internal Audit Assignments, Information

## MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF COMMITTEE ON AUDIT

Trustees of the California State University
Office of the Chancellor
Glenn S. Dumke Conference Center
401 Golden Shore
Long Beach, California

July 21, 2015

### **Members Present**

Lupe C. Garcia, Chair Douglas Faigin, Vice Chair Adam Day Hugo N. Morales Lou Monville, Chair of the Board Timothy P. White, Chancellor

Chair Garcia called the meeting to order.

### **Approval of Minutes**

The minutes of the meeting of May 19, 2015, were approved as submitted.

### **Status Report on Current and Follow-Up Internal Audit Assignments**

Mr. Larry Mandel, vice chancellor and chief audit officer, presented the item by providing a status report on the 2015 audit plan and follow-up on past audit assignments.

Mr. Mandel reported that a majority of the 2015 audit assignments are currently in process. He added that the remaining three subjects, Cloud Computing, Scholarships, and Student Activities, will be initiated in the coming months. He reminded everyone that updates to the status report are displayed in green numerals and indicate progress toward or completion of recommendations since the distribution of the agenda. Mr. Mandel stated that the campuses and the CSU Chancellor's Office continue to do a good job completing recommendations on a timely basis. He noted that there is only one long-outstanding recommendation, and it relates to Sponsored Programs at California State University, Stanislaus. He stated that the campus has indicated that the delay is due to the need for a meet and confer and anticipated completion by the September Board

Mr. Mandel also reported that both the reviews and associated recommendations pertaining to the construction projects are also being completed timely.

Chair Garcia thanked Mr. Mandel and his audit team for the continued progress and the campus presidents and their teams for moving these items forward on the remediation of the action items.

The meeting adjourned.

Agenda Item 1 September 8-9, 2015 Page 1 of 6

### **COMMITTEE ON AUDIT**

### **Status Report on Current and Follow-up Internal Audit Assignments**

### **Presentation By**

Larry Mandel
Vice Chancellor and Chief Audit Officer
Office of Audit and Advisory Services

### **Summary**

This item includes both a status report on the 2015 audit plan and follow-up on past assignments. For the 2015 year, assignments were made to conduct reviews of Auxiliary Organizations, high-risk areas (Information Security, Clery Act, Information Technology (IT) Procurement, Payment Card Industry Data Security Standards, Admissions, Cloud Computing, Scholarships, and Student Activities), a high profile area (College Reviews), and Construction. In addition, follow-up on current/past assignments (Auxiliary Organizations, Accessible Technology, Executive Travel, Sponsored Programs, Continuing Education, Information Security, IT Procurement, College Reviews, and Clery Act) was being conducted on approximately 32 prior campus/auxiliary reviews. Attachment A summarizes the reviews in tabular form. An up-to-date Attachment A will be distributed at the committee meeting.

### **Status Report on Current and Follow-up Internal Audit Assignments**

Auxiliary Organizations

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 267 staff weeks of activity (25.8 percent of the plan) would be devoted to auditing internal compliance/internal control at eight campuses/31 auxiliaries. Two campus/seven auxiliary reports have been completed, two campus/nine auxiliary reports are awaiting a campus response prior to finalization, and report writing is being completed for one campus/four auxiliaries.

High-Risk Areas

### <u>Information Security</u>

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 37 staff weeks of activity (3.7 percent of the plan) would be devoted to a review of the systems and managerial/technical measures for ongoing evaluation of data/information collected; identifying confidential, private or sensitive

Aud Agenda Item 1 September 8-9, 2015 Page 2 of 6

information; authorizing access; securing information; detecting security breaches; and security incident reporting and response. Five campuses will be reviewed. One campus report has been completed, one campus report is awaiting a campus response prior to finalization, and report writing is being completed for two campuses.

### Clery Act

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 50 staff weeks of activity (4.8 percent of the plan) would be devoted to a review of campus Clery Act policies and procedures to ensure compliance with CSU and federal requirements; review and testing of processes to compile required disclosures and statistics for the Annual Security Report (ASR); verification of the availability of educational programs for security awareness, and the prevention and reporting of crime; review and testing of ASR dissemination to required parties; review of campus good-faith efforts to comply with changes to the Clery Act imposed by the Violence Against Women Reauthorization Act (VAWA) for the 2014 ASR and progress in meeting the changes by the July 2015 deadline; and review of content and delivery of training. Six campuses will be reviewed. Three campus reports have been competed, two campus reports are awaiting a campus response prior to finalization, and report writing is being completed for one campus.

### <u>Information Technology Procurement</u>

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 34 staff weeks of activity (3.3 percent of the plan) would be devoted to a review of policies and practices related to information technology procurement. Specific goals will include determining whether administration and management of information technology procurement activities provide an effective internal control environment, adequate local policies and operational procedures, current written delegations, and observance of good business practices in compliance with CSU policy. Five campuses were initially scheduled to be reviewed; due to additional information technology staff resources, six campuses will be visited. Two campus reports have been completed, two campus reports are awaiting a campus response prior to finalization, and fieldwork is being conducted at one campus.

### Payment Card Industry Data Security Standards

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 14 staff weeks of activity (1.4 percent of the plan) would be devoted to a review of campus and auxiliary compliance with regulations specific to Payment Card Industry (PCI) Data Security Standards related to the security and protection of credit cards systems and data. The review would specifically include compliance with the new PCI 3.0 standard. Two campuses will be reviewed. Report writing is being completed for one campus.

Aud Agenda Item 1 September 8-9, 2015 Page 3 of 6

### **Admissions**

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 50 staff weeks of activity (4.8 percent of the plan) would be devoted to a review of the evaluation of student records, including residency determination; processing admission applications, including use of supplemental admission criteria for impacted majors or campuses, transfer students, and redirection of eligible applicants; security of applicant data; application fee processing and granting of fee waivers; and compliance with state legislation and CSU requirements. Six campuses will be reviewed. Report writing is being completed for six campuses.

### **Cloud Computing**

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 11 staff weeks of activity (1.1 percent of the plan) would be devoted to a review of campus and/or auxiliary activities pertaining to cloud computing, including review of policies and procedures to ensure compliance with CSU and other agency requirements; review of campus administration and oversight including but not limited to service availability, data ownership and backup and recovery, establishing contractual relationships with third-party service providers, and if sensitive data is maintained by a third party, review of involvement of campus information security personnel in the decision process; documentation of campus expectations for handling and securing the data; contract language covering security expectations; and monitoring third-party performance. One systemwide report will be issued.

### **Scholarships**

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 43 staff weeks of activity (4.2 percent of the plan) would be devoted to a review of campus and/or auxiliary activities pertaining to scholarships, including establishing student eligibility, awarding, and recordkeeping and protection of sensitive information; coordination between the financial aid department and awarding departments; and review of disbursement procedures for awarded scholarships. Six campuses will be reviewed. Fieldwork is being conducted at four campuses.

### **Student Activities**

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 50 staff weeks of activity (4.8 percent of the plan) would be devoted to a review of activities relating to social and co-curricular programs, recreational sports, student clubs and organizations; review of policies and procedures to ensure compliance with CSU and other agency requirements; review of campus administration and oversight of student activities; review and appropriate testing for compliance with charters, bylaws and/or other governing documents for selected student organizations, clubs and other

Aud Agenda Item 1 September 8-9, 2015 Page 4 of 6

programs; review and testing to ensure appropriate staffing of student programs by qualified individuals and volunteers, including student leaders; and assessment to determine that required policies regarding non-discrimination, alcohol and drugs, and hazing are monitored and enforced. Six campuses will be reviewed.

High Profile Area

### College Reviews

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 49 staff weeks of activity (4.8 percent of the plan) would be devoted to a review of college/department administrative and financial controls, such as handling of cash and cash equivalents, expenditure processing, contracting activities, acquisition and tagging of sensitive equipment, and use of trust funds; and review of faculty assigned time, release time and special payments. Six campuses were initially scheduled to be reviewed; due to resource constraints, only five were visited. Five campus reports have been completed.

### Construction

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 47 staff weeks of activity (4.6 percent of the plan) would be devoted to a review of design budgets and costs; the bid process; invoice processing and change orders; project management, architectural, and engineering services; contractor compliance; cost verification of major equipment and construction components; the closeout process and liquidated damages; and overall project accounting and reporting. Six projects will be reviewed. Two campus reports have been completed, one campus report is awaiting a campus response prior to finalization, report writing is being completed for one project, and fieldwork is being conducted for one project.

### Advisory Services

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 216 staff weeks of activity (20.8 percent of the plan) would be devoted to partnering with management to identify solutions for business issues, offering opportunities to improve the efficiency and effectiveness of operating areas, and assisting with special requests, while ensuring the consideration of related internal control issues. Reviews are ongoing.

Aud Agenda Item 1 September 8-9, 2015 Page 5 of 6

### Technology Support

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 14 staff weeks of activity (1.3 percent of the plan) would be devoted to technology support for non-information technology specific audits and advisory services reviews. The provision of support is ongoing.

### *Investigations*

The Office of Audit and Advisory Services is periodically called upon to provide investigative reviews, which are often the result of alleged defalcations or conflicts of interest. In addition, whistleblower investigations are being performed on an ongoing basis, both by referral from the State Auditor and directly from the CSU Chancellor's Office. Forty-three staff weeks have been set aside for this purpose, representing approximately 4.2 percent of the audit plan.

### Committees/Special Projects

The Office of Audit and Advisory Services is periodically called upon to provide consultation to the campuses and/or to participate on committees such as those related to information systems implementation and policy development, and to perform special projects. Special projects for 2015 will include the implementation of automated working papers in the Office of Audit and Advisory Services. Forty staff weeks have been set aside for this purpose, representing approximately 3.8 percent of the audit plan.

### Follow-ups

The audit plan indicated that approximately 15 staff weeks of activity (1.5 percent of the plan) would be devoted to follow-up on prior audit recommendations. The Office of Audit and Advisory Services is currently tracking approximately 32 current/past assignments (Auxiliary Organizations, Accessible Technology, Executive Travel, Sponsored Programs, Continuing Education, Information Security, IT Procurement, College Reviews, and Clery Act) to determine the appropriateness of the corrective action taken for each recommendation and whether additional action is required.

### Annual Risk Assessment

The Office of Audit and Advisory Services annually conducts a risk assessment to determine the areas of highest risk to the system. Eight staff weeks have been set aside for this purpose, representing approximately 0.8 percent of the audit plan.

Aud Agenda Item 1 September 8-9, 2015 Page 6 of 6

### Administration

Day-to-day administration of the Office of Audit and Advisory Services represents approximately 4.3 percent of the audit plan.

# Status Report on Current and Follow-Up Internal Audit Assignments (as of 9/1/2015)

				2	2015 ASSIGNMENTS	SNMENTS	S					FOLLOV	W-UP PAS	T/CURRE	FOLLOW-UP PAST/CURRENT ASSIGNMENTS	NMENTS	_ ا
	Aux	Info	Clery	College	╘		 I	Cloud		Student		Auxiliary		Acce	Accessible	Executive	utive
	Orgs	Security	Act	Reviews	Procure	PC I	Adm	Comptg	Scholar	Activity	J	Organizations	suc	Techr	Technology	Travel	vel
											•No.	*Recs	**Mo.	*Recs	**Mo.	*Recs	**Mo.
BAK						RW					4	35/35	-				
CHI				AC							3	25/25					
CI							RW				3	32/32	-			9/9	-
DH									FW		3	19/19	-	9/9	-		
EB			AC								3	31/31	1				
FRE		AC					RW				9	36/36	-				
FUL	RW				AC						4						
HUM			ΙΥ								4	30/30	-				
LB	ΙV						AC				4					3/3	-
LA			AC	AC					FW		4	18/18	-	2/2	1		
MA			RW								2	5/13	4				
MB							RW				2	17/23	9				
NOR	AI			AC							5						
POM				AC	ΡM						2	11/11		7/7	ı	4/4	
SAC				AC							5	41/41	-				
SB	AC				A		RW				4	6/23	4				
SD			A								4	21/21		7/7	ı	9/9	•
SF	AC	RW									3	4/17	3	1/1	1		
SJ		AI					RW		ΡW		5	26/26	-			6/6	
SLO			AC						FW		3	11/11	-				
SM											4	22/22	-	4/4	ı		
SON					AC						3	5/5	-				
STA		RW									4	14/14					
CO					A						2	5/5	-			0/3	3
SYS														0/1	4	0/4	2
FW = I AI = A	FW = Field Work In Pr RW = Report Writing in AI = Audit Incomplet conference and AC = Audit Complete	FW = Field Work In Progress RW = Report Writing in Progress AI = Audit Incomplete (awaiting formal exit conference and/or campus response) AC = Audit Complete	ss gress aiting forn impus res		* The number ** The number • The number Numbers/lette	nber of recomber of months of any letters in continuous in	ommendar onths reco dilary orga green are	<ul> <li>* The number of recommendations satisfactorily addressed followec</li> <li>** The number of months recommendations have been outstanding</li> <li>• The number of auxiliary organizations reviewed.</li> <li>Numbers/letters in green are updates since the agenda mailout.</li> </ul>	actorily addins have busineed.	dressed foll sen outstar genda mai	lowed by nding. <b>lout.</b>	/ the numbé	er of recorr	ımendation	<ul> <li>* The number of recommendations satisfactorily addressed followed by the number of recommendations in the original report.</li> <li>** The number of months recommendations have been outstanding.</li> <li>• The number of auxiliary organizations reviewed.</li> <li>Numbers/letters in green are updates since the agenda mailout.</li> </ul>	jinal report.	

\* The number of recommendations satisfactorily addressed followed by the number of recommendations in the original report.
\*\* The number of months recommendations have been outstanding.

The number of auxiliary organizations reviewed.
 Numbers/letters in green are updates since the agenda mailout.

# Status Report on Current and Follow-Up Internal Audit Assignments (as of 9/1/2015)

Sponsored   Continuing   Information   Programs   Feecs   Fe						 	)LLOW-UP	PAST/CUI	RRENT AS	SIGNMENT	S.				
Programs         Education         Security         Procurement recision         Revise rations recision         ***Hoo; Recision rations recision rational rations recision rations recision rational rations recision rational rational rations recision rational ra		Spon	sored	Conti	inuing	Inform	nation			Coli	ege	ŏ	Aue		
**Recs         **Mo.         **Recs		Progi	rams	Educ	cation	Seci	urity	Procur	rement	Revi	ews	ď	t	Admis	sions
666         -         10/10         -         0.05         2         -		*Recs	**Mo.	*Recs	**Mo.	*Recs	**Mo.	*Recs	**Mo.	*Recs	**Mo.	*Recs	**Mo.	*Recs	**Mo.
6/6          11/21         7         0/6         2         0           1/1          1/1         2         0	BAK					10/10	•								
1/1          3/3          0/11         2         0/0          0/6         2         0         0         1         0	CHI	9/9	•			11/21	7			0/5	2				
1010         3/3         -         0/11         2         0	CI	1/1	ı												
10/10         3.3          0/11         2         0          0         0          0	DH														
10/10         .         2/2         .         0/01         2         0/0         .         0         0         .         0         0         .         0 <t< td=""><td>EB</td><td></td><td></td><td>3/3</td><td>1</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>9/0</td><td>2</td><td></td><td></td></t<>	EB			3/3	1							9/0	2		
10/10         -         2/2         -         4/4         -         0/0         -         0/0         -         0/0         -         0/0         -         0/0         -         0/0         -         0/0         -         0/0         -         0/0         -         0/0         -         0/0         -         0/0         -         0/0         -         0/0         0         -         0/0         -         0/0         0         -         0/0         0         -         0/0         0 </td <td>FRE</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>0/11</td> <td>2</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>	FRE					0/11	2								
7/7          4/4          4/4          0/0         0         0         0         0         <	FUL	10/10	•	2/2	-			0/0	•						
7/7          5/6         6         0/4         2         0/3         2         0/0           7/7          5         0         0         4         2         0/3         2         0           3/3          5/5          6/5	HUM					4/4	1								
777          0,7         5         0,4         2         0,3           3/3          0,7         5         0	LB					1/6	2							0/0	
777         -         -         0/7         5         - <td>٩</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>0/4</td> <td>2</td> <td>0/3</td> <td>2</td> <td></td> <td></td>	٩									0/4	2	0/3	2		
3/3       -       5/5       -       4/4       1/4       3         3/3       -       5/5       -       0/10       5       0/3       3         3/3       -       0/10       5       0       0/8       3       0         4/4       -       5/6       4       0       0       0       0       0         7/7       -       5/6       4       0       0       0       0       0       0       0         6/7       13       1/3       6       0	MA	2/2	•			2/0	5								
8/8       -       5/5       -       1/4       3         3/3       -       6/7       -       0/10       5       0/3       3         4/4       -       5/6       4       -       0/10       5       -       -         7/7       -       5/6       4       -       -       -       -       -       -         0/0       -       -       5/6       4       - <td>MB</td> <td>3/3</td> <td>•</td> <td></td>	MB	3/3	•												
3/3       -       60/3       3         4/4       -       5/6       4       0/10       5       0       0/8       3         4/4       -       5/6       4       0       0       0       0       0/3         7/7       -       5/6       4       0       0       0       0/3         0/0       -       0       0       0       0       0/3         6/7       13       1/3       6       0       0       0       0       0         2/5       4       2/2       -       0	NOR	8/8		5/2						1/4	3				
4/4         -         0/10         5         0         0/8         3           4/4         -         5/6         4         0/10         5         0	POM	3/3	•							0/3	3				
4/4         -         0/10         5         6         6         7/7         6         7/7         6         7/7         6         7/7         6         7/2         7	SAC									8/0	3				
4/4       -       5/6       4       6       7       6       6       6       6       7       6       7       6       7       6       7       6       7       6       7       7       7       7       7       7       7       7       7       7       7       7       7       7       7       7       8       7       8       7       8       7       8 <td>SB</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>2/2</td> <td>-</td> <td>0/10</td> <td>5</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>	SB			2/2	-	0/10	5								
4/4       -       5/6       4       0/3         7/7       -       0/0       0/0       0/0       0/0         6/7       13       1/3       6       0/0       0/0       0/0         2/5       4       2/2       -       0/0       0/0       0/0       0/0	SD														
7/7       -       0/3         0/0       -       0/0       -         6/7       1/3       6       0/0       -         2/5       4       2/2       -       0	SF	4/4	•	9/9	4										
7/7         -         0/3           0/0         -         0/0         -           6/7         1/3         6         -           2/5         4         2/2         -	SJ														
0/0     -     0/0       6/7     13     1/3     6       2/5     4     2/2     -	SLO	2/2	•									0/3	2		
0/0     -     0/0       6/7     13     1/3     6       2/5     4     2/2     -	SM														
6/7 13 1/3 2/5 4 2/2	SON	0/0	ı					0/0	ı						
2/5 4 2/2	STA	2/9	13	1/3	9										
2/5 4 2/2	CO														
	SYS	2/5	4	2/2											

Status Report on Current and Follow-Up Construction Audit Assignments (as of 9/1/2015)

Project	l	Project	Contractor	Construction	Start	Comp.	Managed	Current	Campus F	<b>Current Campus Follow-Up</b>	CPDC Follow-Up	Ilow-Up
No.				Cost	Date	Date	Ву	*	**RECS	***MO.	**RECS	**МО.
BAK-230 A	⋖	Art Center and Satellite Plant	Rudolph and Sletten	\$14,290,932	5/27/2013	May-14	Campus	AC	0/1	4		
POM-1039 F		Recreation Center	C W Driver	\$43,135,626	8/20/2012	Jan-15	Campus	AC	0/0	•		
SD-623	0)	Storm/Nasatir Halls Renovation	C W Driver	\$52,972,562	6/27/2012	Sep-14	Campus	AI				
MA-235 F	4	Physical Education Replacement	Gilbane Building Co.	\$27,540,143	3/27/2013	Jan-15	00	RW				
BAK-816		Student Housing Northeast, Ph I	Bernards Brothers, Inc.	\$32,479,629	6/10/2013	Jan-15	Campus	ΡW				
V = Field	~	*FW = Field Work in Progress; RW = Report Writing in Progres	/riting in Progress; $AI = AL$	ss; AI = Audit Incomplete (awaiting formal exit conference and/or response); AC	awaiting form	nal exit con	ference an	d/or respor	nse); AC =	= Audit Complete	olete	
he numb	=	**The number of recommendations satisfactorily addressed followed by the number of recommedations in the original report.	ly addressed followed by t	the number of re	commedatior	ns in the or	iginal repor	t.				
The numb	-0	***The number of months that recommendations have been ou	is have been outstanding.									