

401 Golden Shore, 5th Floor
Long Beach, CA 90802-4210

CSU Legislative Reports Website
<https://www.calstate.edu/legislativereports/>

Steve Relyea
Executive Vice Chancellor
and Chief Financial Officer

562-951-4600
srelyea@calstate.edu

April 9, 2020

Honorable Holly Mitchell, Chair
Joint Legislative Budget Committee
State Capitol, Room 5080
Sacramento, CA 95814

Gabriel Petek
Legislative Analyst Office
925 L Street, #1000
Sacramento, CA 95814

Keely Bosler, Director
Department of Finance
State Capitol, Room 1145
Sacramento, CA 95814

Erika Contreras
Secretary of the Senate
State Capitol, Room 3044
Sacramento, CA 95814

Diane Boyer-Vine
Legislative Counsel
State Capitol, Room 3021
Sacramento, CA 95814

Sue Parker
Chief Clerk of the Assembly
State Capitol, Room 3196
Sacramento, CA 95814

RE: Summary of Hiring Practices

This report provides an overview of the current hiring practices for California State University (CSU) positions. It compares the hiring practices at the CSU to the hiring practices to similar positions at the University of California (UC) and the California Community Colleges (CCC).

This report is in compliance with Section 89291 of the Education Code, which provides that the Office of the Chancellor of the CSU shall prepare an annual systemwide report that includes a summary of current hiring practices for all CSU positions, including executive, management, faculty, and nonfaculty support staff positions. The systemwide report shall compare hiring practices at the CSU to the best practices for hiring persons to similar positions at the UC and the CCC.

Should you have any questions about this report, please contact Nichole Muñoz-Murillo, Assistant Vice Chancellor, Advocacy and State Relations at (916) 445-5983.

CSU Campuses
Bakersfield
Channel Islands
Chico
Dominguez Hills
East Bay

Fresno
Fullerton
Humboldt
Long Beach
Los Angeles
Maritime Academy

Monterey Bay
Northridge
Pomona
Sacramento
San Bernardino
San Diego

San Francisco
San José
San Luis Obispo
San Marcos
Sonoma
Stanislaus

CSU Report: Summary of Hiring Practices

April 9, 2020

Page 2

Sincerely,


Steven Relyea (Apr 9, 2020)

Steve Relyea
Executive Vice Chancellor and
Chief Financial Officer

SR:dr

Full report posted to <https://www.calstate.edu/legislativereports/>

- c: Members, California State Legislature
Members, Joint Legislative Budget Committee
Timothy P. White, Chancellor, California State University
Loren J. Blanchard, Executive Vice Chancellor, Academic and Student Affairs
Evelyn Nazario, Vice Chancellor, Human Resources
Garrett Ashley, Vice Chancellor, University Relations and Advancement
Nichole Muñoz-Murillo, Assistant Vice Chancellor, Advocacy and State Relations
Ryan Storm, Assistant Vice Chancellor for Budget
Kara Perkins, Executive Budget Director

California State University Report: Summary of Hiring Practices

Authority

Pursuant to Education Code Section 89291, enclosed is California State University's (CSU) systemwide report which summarizes current hiring practices for CSU positions, categorized in employee groups. This report also summarizes and compares the practices for hiring individuals in similar employee groups at the University of California (UC) and the California Community Colleges (CCC).

Introduction

As California's public postsecondary systems of higher education, the CSU, UC, and CCC are committed to teaching students throughout the state of California and producing graduates with the knowledge and critical thinking skills necessary for the advanced jobs of tomorrow. As Equal Employment Opportunity employers, the colleges and universities in these three systems share common hiring principles and values that are evidenced in their practices. As required by the above-mentioned legislation, the CSU has reviewed the recruitment and hiring policies, procedures and guidelines produced by the CSU's and UC's headquarter/systemwide offices. Since the CCCs have a decentralized structure (each district is responsible for its own recruitment and hiring guidelines), the CSU selected and reviewed recruitment and hiring documents for three California community college districts identified by the CCC Chancellor's Office as having noteworthy best practices in EEO and diversity¹.

Background

The California State University (CSU)

The CSU is the nation's largest four-year public university system with 23 campuses and eight off-campus centers. The CSU educates approximately 481,000 students and employs nearly 53,000 faculty and staff. The CSU is authorized to grant baccalaureate and master's degrees as well as teaching credentials. The CSU is committed to the recruitment and hiring of a diverse workforce that makes contributions to equity and inclusion in the pursuit of excellence for all members of the CSU community. The CSU is governed by a Board of Trustees that appoints the chief executive officer of the system (the Chancellor), Chancellor's Office executive officers (Executive Vice Chancellors/Vice Chancellors, as well as the Presidents of each individual campuses).

The University of California (UC)

The UC is California's system of public research universities. It educates more than 280,000 students and employs more than 227,000 employees across its 10 campuses, five medical centers, and three affiliated national laboratories². The UC system is constitutionally separate from the

¹ <https://www.cccco.edu/-/media/CCCCO-Website/About-Us/Reports/Files/2016-EEO-and-Diversity-Handbook-ADA.ashx>

² <https://www.universityofcalifornia.edu/uc-system>

Legislature and is governed by an appointed Board of Regents, who selects the chief executive officer of the system (President) and the chief executive officers of each UC campus (Chancellor).

The California Community Colleges (CCC)

The CCC is the largest system of higher education in the nation, with over 2.1 million students attending 115 colleges organized into 72 districts. Its community colleges offer associate degrees, transfer education, and workforce development programs. The statewide CCC system is governed by a Board of Governors, who oversees the colleges and selects the Chancellor for the system. Each of the 72 community college districts in the state also has a locally-elected board of trustees that is charged with policy leadership for the district and selects a district chief executive officer (CEO) (also known as a Superintendent/President or Chancellor), who provides leadership over individual college campuses.

Each district creates its own policies and administrative regulations, which includes the recruitment and appointment of Staff, Faculty, Management, and Executive employees (each employee group is described below). The CSU selected and reviewed the hiring process for the following three community college districts: Ohlone, Hartnell, and Los Rios.

Employee Groups

Due to the variation in which each respective system of higher education refers to its groups of employees, we have organized the employee groups into four categories and have summarized them below:

Faculty: this employee group includes tenure-track instructional faculty, librarians, and counselors (probationary and tenured), as well as temporary instructional faculty, referred to as “lecturers” in the CSU, and temporary coaches, counselors and librarians.

Staff: this employee group includes non-faculty, professional and support staff. Employees may be represented under a collective bargaining agreement.

Management: this employee group includes employees with management or supervisory responsibilities. This group is classified as Management Personnel Plan (MPP) employees at the CSU. At the UC, this group is identified as Management and Senior Professionals (MSP).

Executive: this employee group is known as the Executive Management classification and includes the Chancellor, Presidents, Vice Chancellors, and General Counsel at the CSU. At the UC, this employee group is referred to as the Senior Management Group (SMG) and consists of the senior leadership of the campuses and the systemwide administration, including Chancellors, Provosts, Vice Provosts and the President. At the CCC, this group includes the Chancellor, Superintendent/Presidents or Chancellors of individual colleges, Vice Chancellors, and Vice Presidents.

Shared Principles and Comparing Hiring Practices

The CSU, UC, and CCC are Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) employers. “Equal Employment Opportunity” is defined as ensuring that all qualified individuals have a full and fair opportunity to compete for hiring and promotional opportunities, as well as to enjoy the benefits of employment

with the respective employer. As such, these three postsecondary systems of higher education have expressed an ongoing commitment to the principles of equal employment opportunity that conform to federal and state laws. Each institution promotes hiring practices that maintain the confidentiality of its applicants, are nondiscriminatory, and advance diversity efforts. An example of this shared commitment is the CSU and UC's collaboration on the Moving Beyond Bias learning program³ that explains and explores unconscious/implicit bias and methods to reduce its harmful effects on CSU and UC campuses. This initiative is intended to reach the entire workforce of both systems and foster meaningful, sustainable impacts to campus communities.

Common hiring practices among the three postsecondary systems of higher education include: advertising for a job vacancy, advertising through a broad range of sources in order to obtain a larger and more diverse candidate pool, screening criteria based on job announcements, conducting interviews with candidates, and conducting reference checks for final candidates. There is also an emphasis on confidentiality in the search process.

While they share common EEO principles, the CSU, UC, and CCC differ slightly in ways they execute these principles. For example, the three systems (and even among different community college districts) differ in the composition of their search committees. The composition of the search committees also differs with respect to the types of positions being filled. In general, a training or orientation meeting which covers diversity issues such as implicit bias, confidentiality, anti-discrimination, and equity is recommended for all search committee members prior to the screening of applicants.

Many components of faculty hiring are comparable across all three systems. Key areas include the following:

Advertising and outreach

Campuses of the UC engage in national recruitment and outreach for tenure-track positions. They advertise open positions in ways that highlight support of diverse communities, and monitor recruitment efforts. Like the UC, CSU campuses also recruit nationally, engage in outreach to underrepresented communities, and monitor recruitment outcomes; position announcements include statements highlighting the campus's commitment to diversity and inclusion. Community college campuses do not necessarily recruit nationally, but they do make efforts to advertise widely and, in particular, take steps to make sure that members of underrepresented groups are aware of vacancies.

Training for search committees and others involved in recruitments

All three systems have invested in training in implicit bias and applying effective recruitment strategies. Each CSU campus has developed training approaches based on campus culture and needs, additionally the Chancellor's Office makes on-line training available to all campuses and supports the dissemination of successful training models for those campuses who are revising or expanding their efforts.

Search process

The UC has implemented UC Recruit, a common, web-based academic personnel recruitment system. UC Recruit facilitates data collection about the diversity of candidate pools and finalists. Campuses use multiple strategies including requiring "contributions to diversity" statements from

³ <https://movingbeyondbias.org/>

candidates and having “equity advisors” on each search committee. The CSU is in the midst of implementing a common on-line recruiting platform that will enable better data collection and analysis of applicant pools, as well as alerting search committees to candidates who have participated in CSU “pipeline” programs that seek to develop future faculty with the appropriate skills to work effectively with the CSU’s diverse student bodies. The CSU is in the process of collaborating with the UC to share information regarding promising practices for data collection and analysis. Campuses not only ask for statements regarding contributions to student success, diversity, and inclusion, but are increasingly educating search committees on how to evaluate and screen candidates on these criteria. Several campuses have recently revised their search processes with the goal of reducing/eliminating bias as well as creating a more welcoming and inviting experience for candidates.

Building the faculty pipeline

The UC’s President’s Postdoctoral Fellowship Program (PPFP) offers postdoctoral fellowships, professional development, and mentoring to scholars whose research, teaching, and service will contribute to diversity and equal opportunity in the UC. Both salary and start-up incentives are available to campuses that hire PPFP participants. The CSU offers the California Pre-Doctoral Program to encourage CSU students from disadvantaged and low-income backgrounds to continue to the doctorate level. In addition, the Chancellor’s Doctoral Incentive Program (CDIP) provides forgivable loans, mentoring, small grants, and professional development to promising doctoral students with the skills and motivation to teach CSU’s diverse student population. About 60% of CDIP Graduates who go on to become CSU faculty come from underrepresented minority groups and roughly 70% are more likely to be female than the CSU tenure-track faculty as a whole.

Summary of Hiring Practices

Pursuant to the requirements of the report, this final section contains a brief summary of each system’s hiring practices.

CSU

Executive Hiring

Under the Rules Governing the Board of Trustees of the California State University⁴, the Chancellor of the CSU is responsible for the search and selection of Vice Chancellors and the General Counsel. The Chancellor recommends one final candidate for appointment by the Board of Trustees. At a minimum, the process should include representation from the trustees, and advice from one or more presidents, faculty, students and staff.

Under the Board of Trustees Policy for the Selection of Presidents⁵, a Trustees Committee for the Selection of the President (TCSP) is created when a campus has an impending vacancy. The TCSP is comprised of the Chair of the Board of Trustees, four Trustees, and the Chancellor. While the TCSP is responsible for making the final decisions, including the advancement of candidates to the Board of Trustees, the process includes campus representatives. An advisory group to the TCSP, known as the Advisory Committee to the Trustees Committee for the Selection of the President (ACTCSP), provides advice and consultation regarding the position and campus descriptions and any advertisement of the position. The ACTCSP is composed of the Chair of the Academic Senate on the

⁴ <https://calstate.policystat.com/policy/7197624/latest/>

⁵ <https://www2.calstate.edu/csu-system/about-the-csu/leadership/presidents/Documents/csu-bot-presidential-selection-policy.pdf>

campus, two faculty representatives selected by the campus faculty, one member of the campus support staff selected by the staff, two students selected by the duly constituted representatives of the campus student body, one member of the campus Advisory Board selected by that board, one alumnus/alumna of the campus selected by the campus Alumni Association, one Vice President or academic Dean for the campus, and the President of another CSU campus selected by the Chancellor. The Chair of the Board or the Chancellor may appoint up to two additional members to the ACTCSP. An executive search firm may be used during the selection process; however, the TCSP determines the attributes desired for the successful candidate, approves the final campus and job descriptions, posts advertising copies, reviews and interviews candidates, and conducts background and reference checks of the final candidate who is advanced to the Board of Trustees for appointment.

Staff and Management Hiring

The search process for Staff and Management positions consists of five phases: pre-recruitment (creation of the position announcement, formation of the search committee); recruitment (application submissions); screening; interviews; and selection and offer of employment. Recommendations for campuses are provided under each phase, and each individual campus is expected to adapt the guidelines to their own needs and develop internal policies and practices for Staff and Management searches.

During the pre-recruitment phase, a position announcement which is consistent with duties and requirements of the position is posted. The position announcement includes the classification title, skill level, description of job duties, desirable experience, minimum qualifications (when applicable), salary range for the classification or sub-range applicable to the skill (where applicable), and specialized skill if any.

A selection committee is identified and the members are given an orientation to understand the policies on recruitment, particularly as they relate to anti-discrimination and equity. The selection committee members are responsible for the initial recruitment, candidate screening, and identification of a group of finalists for the recruitment. Efforts are made to ensure that the search committee composition invites diverse perspectives and equitably represents the campus community.

The process involves screening applicants based on the stated qualifications indicated in the position announcement. The most qualified applicants meeting the minimum and preferred qualifications are interviewed. Campus visits by candidates are encouraged in order to meet members of the department and allow the campus to highlight the benefits of working for the CSU.

Faculty Hiring

Faculty hiring processes are determined by CSU policies and guidelines, campus-specific policies, and provisions of the collective bargaining agreement (CBA) between the California Faculty Association (CFA)⁶, the exclusive representative of faculty members in the CSU, and the CSU. The CSU's Faculty recruitment process is similar to the process outlined above for Staff and Management positions. The following describes features specific to faculty hiring.

The CBA between CFA and the CSU governs faculty appointments including but not limited to posting of positions requirements for peer review committees. Consistent with the CBA as well as

⁶ <https://www2.calstate.edu/csu-system/faculty-staff/labor-and-employee-relations/Pages/unit3-cfa.aspx>

CSU guidelines, campuses carry out national searches for tenure-track faculty positions, and advertise widely in major higher education outlets that are likely to reach diverse candidates. Campus protocols require approved recruitment plans that regularly include additional outreach to personal and professional networks. The Chancellor's Doctoral Incentive Program (CDIP), which provides forgivable loans to outstanding doctoral students who have the skills and motivation to teach the diverse students of the CSU, publishes an annual directory of doctoral recipients, and campuses are encouraged to "mine" this resource for potential candidates. (The program also offers subsidies to campuses to defray interview costs when CDIP participants are interviewed.)

While academic departments are largely responsible for the creation of the position announcement, campus policy and best practices also drive content regarding the campus commitment to equal opportunity and inclusion. Additionally, position announcements are reviewed to make sure that they have not been written in ways that would unnecessarily exclude candidates or overly narrow the pool. Increasingly, candidates are asked to provide a statement with their application that describes their own experience in working in a highly diverse environment as well as their approach and commitment to the success of all students, including those from underrepresented or disadvantaged backgrounds.

Campuses offer training to search committee members, in addition to discussing search protocols and equal employment opportunity practices, content related to reducing explicit and implicit bias, as well as best practices for carrying out an equitable search. Campuses also utilize on-line training modules provided by the Chancellor's Office.

While the CBA requires an elected search committee, CSU guidelines strongly encourage that departments try to ensure that the search committee has diversity among its members. In the screening process, committees are expected to evaluate candidates against the stated criteria, including candidates' commitment to inclusion, equity, and diversity.

The CSU's guidelines also address the importance of the interview and campus visit in recruiting outstanding candidates, and provide strategies for ensuring candidates feel welcome and understand the benefits of a career in the CSU.

The lecturer hiring process differs in several important ways from tenure-track hiring. First, most lecturer recruitments are for part-time, contingent positions, and national searches are not required. Typically, national searches are only used when recruiting for a full-time appointment with a defined specialization where broader advertising is needed to attract qualified candidates. Second, the CBA provides significant preference for reappointment for lecturers with experience at the campus, as well as substantial job security for lecturers with six or more years of experience in an academic department. Third, in contrast to the lengthy cycle for tenure-track hiring, new part-time lecturers are often hired from an existing pool and can be appointed within a few weeks or even days before the start of an academic term, based on a need to add class sections to meet student demand, unexpected vacancies, and so forth. Departments will often advertise to attract candidates for lecturer pools in subject areas where the department expects vacancies to occur. Recruitment for pools are typically focused on the geographic area where the campus is located, and will often involve outreach to other universities and community colleges in the region to identify qualified individuals who have an interest in part-time work.

UC

Staff, Management, and Executive Hiring

The UC Office of the President's (UCOP) Policy on Recruitment and Promotion⁷ contains recruitment requirements and applies to positions in the Staff, Management, and Executive employee groups. The UC requires a competitive recruitment for its vacant positions unless an exception permits. A "competitive recruitment" is defined by the UC as activities related to seeking a broad and diverse pool of candidates to fill the vacant positions. Activities may include advertising a position, communicating with applicants, conducting interviews and assessments, performing reference checks, and extending offers of employment. The competitive recruitment process includes the following steps: authorization to recruit, an updated position description, advertising to attract a broad and diverse pool of qualified applicants, assessment of candidates against the minimum and preferred qualifications set out in the position description, and the selection and appointment of a candidate.

Faculty Hiring

In the University of California, tenure-track faculty are not unionized. Academic personnel policy is governed by the Academic Personnel Manual (APM)⁸. The APM includes provisions for recruitments and appointment. Non-tenure-track faculty ("non-Senate faculty") are unionized, and therefore are subject to provisions of collective bargaining as well as the APM. Within these frameworks, the ten individual UC campuses have each developed their own recruitment practices.

UCOP's Office of Academic Personnel and Programs also provides resources supporting faculty diversity. These include the following publications: Guidelines for Addressing Race and Gender Equity in Academic Programs in Compliance with Proposition 209, Affirmative Action Guidelines for Recruitment and Retention of Faculty, Evaluating Contributions to Diversity for Faculty Appointment and Promotion, as well as documents that spell out responsibilities of search committees, chairs, and deans.

CCC

Executive Hiring

The general search process for a district Superintendent/President or Chancellor consists of the following steps: assessment of the community college district and the type of leadership needed; decision regarding whether or not a consultant is needed; establishment of a search committee consisting of key college personnel and community members who will screen applicants, interview applicants, and forward names to the board for further consideration; and the board's final selection.

Faculty Hiring

Statewide efforts to promote equal employment opportunity for faculty include provision of training, increased efforts to collect statewide faculty demographic and diversity data from local districts, creation of an EEO resource archive, and establishment of a statewide EEO and Diversity Advisory Committee.

Hiring at Ohlone Community College District

The recruitment process for Staff, Management, and Executive positions (with the exception of the Superintendent/President recruitment) at Ohlone Community College District is outlined under the district's Recruitment and Hiring Guidelines⁹. The recruitment process among these employee

⁷ <https://policy.ucop.edu/doc/4010393/PPSM-20>

⁸ <https://www.ucop.edu/academic-personnel-programs/academic-personnel-policy/>

⁹ <https://www.ohlone.edu/sites/default/files/documents/imported/recruitmentandhiringguidelines.pdf>

groups are similar, with the exception of the makeup of the Screening Committee. For all vacancies, the process consists of an approval process, the screening committee chair selection, and an orientation meeting for selected committee members. The orientation meeting with the committee members is held covering the following main components: discussion of the ideal candidate; vision for the position; EEO refresher; confidentiality commitment and signing of the commitment form; discussion of logistics and timeline; creation of screening device based on the job description and job announcement; and development of the initial interview questions. Following the orientation, committee members may begin screening applicants, identify candidates for interview, conduct initial interviews and assessments (if applicable), conduct final interviews, and select a final candidate.

The hiring process for Vice Presidents and Associate Vice Presidents usually consists of a Screening Committee with the following members: one Vice President/Associate Vice President appointed by the President/Superintendent; three administrators appointed by the President/Superintendent; two faculty members, at least one staff employee, one optional student, and an EEO representative.

The makeup of the Screening Committee for Management hiring at Ohlone Community College District usually consists of the following members: two administrators (at least one from the area, when possible); at least one faculty member (depending on the extent to which the position involved faculty interaction); two staff employees; and one EEO representative. The final interview panel for a management position is made up of the President/Superintendent and Vice President or Associate Vice President of the division. The committee chair is also invited to participate. The final decision to hire is made by the President/Superintendent in consultation with the Vice President or Associate Vice President of the division and/or the committee chair.

Hiring at Hartnell Community College District

The recruitment process for Staff and Management positions at Hartnell Community College District involves the following: job advertising, formation of a Selection Committee with equitable gender and ethnic representation, development of interview questions and desired responses, applicant screening, applicant interviews, and notification of job selection. For Staff positions, the Selection Committee and Chair are selected by an administrator and approved by Human Resources.

For Management positions at Hartnell Community College District, the Selection Committee and Chair are selected with input from the Superintendent/President, Executive Cabinet, Academic Senate, staff senate, Associated Students, and department/area, as appropriate. The Committee selects the top 3 finalists and submits all documentation to Human Resources for review and approval. For certain positions, the Committee typically selects the finalists, but for others, the Committee's work concludes when the documentation is submitted to Human Resources.

Los Rios Community College District

The Staff hiring process at Los Rios Community College District is outlined under the Equity Handbook for Hiring Process¹⁰. The general hiring process includes the following: recruitment/advertisement, initial committee meeting, screening/interview questions development, screen/select interviews, interview/rank candidates, second level interview (optional), reference checks, and selection. This process involves three committees: the Hiring Committee that is responsible for reviewing applications received from Human Resources and

¹⁰ <https://employees.losrios.edu/docs/lrccd/employees/hr/hiring/equity-hiring-handbook.pdf>

interviewing applicants; the Screening Committee that rates all applicants independently; and the Interview Committee that agrees on the procedures, core questions to be asked during interviews, rating system, and time limit for the interviews. The composition of the Hiring Committee for Staff positions includes a manager/supervisor, a trained equity representative, a staff member, and (as appropriate) a faculty member. The Screening Committee consists of generally the dean or director, a trained equity representative, a staff member, and as appropriate a faculty member. The Interview Committee is appointed by the College President or Administrative Officer and includes a manager/supervisor, one staff member, and the equity representative. A faculty member may be included on the interview committee if the position interfaces with academic staff. The College President or campus Vice President of Administrative Services selects the final candidate who is recommended to the Chancellor and the Board of Trustees for appointment to the position. Following Board approval, the final candidate will be given formal notice of the appointment by Human Resources.

The Management hiring process at Los Rios Community College District involves the following phases: establishing need and prioritization, recruitment, screening for eligibility, interview committee/screening committee, screening applications, interviews, reference checks, and selection/final interviews. The composition of the committees differ slightly from the Staff hiring committees. The Screening Committee for Management positions consists of at least the Chancellor or designated manager (for a district position), or the President or designated manager (for a college position); the immediate supervisor of the position to be filled or a management designee; a management member who has been appointed as the equity representative, and two faculty representatives appointed by the Academic Senate President for educational management programs. The Interview Committee composition is typically the same as the Screening Committee; however, additional representatives will be added if necessary. The Chancellor will review all recommendations for Management positions. If approved, the recommendation will be forwarded to the Board of Trustees.