

Academic Senate CSU (ASCSU)

401 Golden Shore, Suite 243
Long Beach, CA 90802-4210

www.calstate.edu/csu-system/faculty-staff/academic-senate

Beth A. Steffel, Chair

Phone: 909-781-1820
E-mail: bsteffel@csusb.edu

**ASCSU Plenary Minutes
November 3 - 4, 2022
Office of the Chancellor (Virtual)**

Thursday, November 3, 2022, 8AM - 5PM

- **Thursday, November 3, 2022, 8AM - 10AM** Privilege (JEDI) Training
- **Thursday, November 3, 2022, 12:30PM - 1:30PM** New Senator Orientation
- **Thursday, November 3, 2022, 5:15PM - 6:30PM** Senate Social

Friday, November 4, 2022, 8AM - 3:15PM

Senators: Mark Martinez, Janet Millar, Monica Pereira, Greg Wood, Elizabeth "Betsy" Boyd (Member-at-Large), Rick Ford, Thomas Norman (Vice Chair), Laura Talamante, Paul Carpenter, Meiling Wu-Winiarski, Michael Jenkins, Susan Schlievert, Kristi Kanel, Michael Milligan, Jason Shepard, Stephanie Burkhalter, Monty Mola, Norbert Schurer (CSULB substitute), Eileen Klink, Praveen Soni, Kris Bezdecny, Heidi Riggio, Christine Isakson, William Tsai, Ryne Leuzinger, Scott Waltz, Boris Ricks, Elizabeth Sussman-Dabach, Adam Swenson (Member-at-Large), Keith Forward, Nicholas Von Glahn (CalPoly Pomona, substitute), Kristin Van Gaasbeck, Carolyn Gibbs, Tracy Hamilton, Beth A. Steffel (Chair), Mark Groen, Nola Butler-Byrd, Eniko Csomay, Cezar Ornatowski, Robert Keith Collins (Immediate Past Chair), Nancy Gerber, Santhi Kavuri-Bauer (SFSU substitute), Julia Curry-Rodriguez, Simon Rodan (Friday only), Mark Van Selst (Secretary), Gary Laver, Steven Rein, David Barsky, Michelle Ramos Pellicia, Elaine Newman, Richard Senghas, Steven Filling, Dana Nakano, Jerry Schulte, Leo Van Cleve (Chancellor's ex-officio representative to the Academic Senate)

Invited Guests / Others: Alison Wrynn (CSU CO); Brent Foster (CSU CO); Reem Osman (Staff); Leslie Kennedy (CSU CO); Tracy Butler (Director); Romey Sabalius (Faculty Trustee); Audrena Redmond (Privilege Training); Kim Geron (Privilege Training); Nena Torrez (Privilege Training); Jamilah Bellinger (Privilege Training); Jolene Koester (Interim CSU Chancellor); Leslie Gilbert-Lurie (CSU Trustee); Jose Antonio Vargas (CSU Trustee); Jean P. Firstenberg (CSU Trustee); Charles Toombs (California Faculty Association president); Dixie Samaniego (California State Student Association - Vice President of Systemwide Affairs); Sylvia A. Alva (Executive Vice Chancellor of Academic and Student Affairs); Leora Freedman (Acting Vice Chancellor for Human Resources: CSU Systemwide Title IX & DHR Assessment); Lyn Harper (Mercer); Jeni Kitchell (CSU CO)

CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

With a quorum being present, the meeting was called to order and Chair Steffel welcomed the body.

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Approved

APPROVAL OF THE SEPTEMBER 8-9, 2022 MINUTES

[Approved](#)

ANNOUNCEMENTS

When Women Lead, Title IX, and A CSU Culture of Care with Chancellor Koester and Board of Trustees Chair Wenda Fong. Live at CSU Dominguez Hills I&I Lecture Hall, Noon - 1:30PM and via systemwide webinar.

PRESENTATIONS/INTRODUCTIONS

Introduction of substitute/new senators: Carpenter (East Bay), Schurer (Long Beach), Kavuri-Bauer (San Francisco), and Monte Mola (Humboldt)

REPORTS

[Academic Senate CSU Chair's Report](#)

Standing committees

- [Academic Affairs \(AA\)](#)
 - *Comment in response to a question:* Graduate Records Examination (GRE) is optional for Campuses to use (or not) for graduate admissions
- [Faculty Affairs \(FA\)](#)
 - No questions
- [Academic Preparation and Educational Programs \(APEP\)](#)
 - No questions
- [Fiscal and Governmental Affairs \(FGA\)](#)
- [Justice, Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion \(JEDI\)](#)
 - *Comment* in response to a question: the JEDI Liaison to ASCSU committees will visit for approximately 15 minutes, to be available as a committee resource.

Other committees, committee liaisons and specialists

- [Legislative Specialists](#)
 - Preparation work with Legislative Analyst's Office (LAO) and Governor's Office regarding compact (as a gestalt and as a floor not a ceiling on funding) & the department of finance
 - Roughly 25% of legislative representatives may be new
 - New focus on committee on higher education (Christopher Francis, Chair)

- [General Education Advisory Committee \(GEAC\)](#)
- **CSU Faculty Trustee** – Romey Sabalius
 - Board of Trustees (the Board) agenda is not published yet because it is more than 10 days out
 - The September meeting of the Board is where budget ask is established
 - Board Education Policy Committee (Sabalius, Chair) will include:
 - Veteran services
 - Board of Trustees regarding Graduation initiative (disaggregated by race and ethnicity)
 - Board of Trustees regarding High School requirements (4th year of Quantitative Reasoning as an information item)
 - Recommendation was based on “authentic access” – presence is predictive of success; the information item suggests that the 4th year of math is predictive of success. Access to appropriate coursework is limited and/or capacity limited in under-resourced districts.
 - **Comment:** removing the quantitative reasoning/mathematics entrance requirement (aka barrier) for the CSU, we need more support for remediation, bridge programs, and to not have these “extra units” for the students aren’t seen as delaying timely graduation rates.
 - **Comment:** the 97% number seems high given the observed performance of students in what was previously called “early start” [now “*Supportive Pathways for First Year Students Program*”] (it is even more important to ensure that students hit the learning outcomes because the proportion of students nominally hitting the target of a 4th year course in QR)
 - **Comment:** the move on the CSU Chancellor’s Office (CO) to move from support for a 4th year of Quantitative Reasoning (QR) to signaling a move from a 4th year of QR seems unusual given the lack of consultation with the ASCSU.
 - The Board is searching for 5 campus presidents: CSU Los Angeles, Sonoma State University, CSU Chico State, CSU Sacramento, San Jose State University.
 - **Question:** Would term limits for presidents/chancellors make sense?
~ **Answer:** unlikely
 - **Question:** Are we losing presidents because of enrollment issues?
~ **Answer:** No, enrollment does not appear to be the primary driver.
 - Campus enrollment reductions will lead to campus budget consequences.
 - ASCSU “TrusTea-Time” will continue (next on November 17th, at 5:15)

TRAINING

- Justice, Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion Committee (JEDI): Training (**Thursday AM**)
 - Land Acknowledgement
 - Defining Privilege
 - Video (snail and caterpillar)
 - Discussion of Privilege – define, recognition, intersectionality, challenges, dismantling systems of oppression
- Justice, Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion Committee: Post-training discussion (**Friday PM**)

SPEAKERS

Jolene Koester, Interim CSU Chancellors (Thursday)

- An overarching principle of Chancellor Koester is to meet student needs.
- Why are the trustees joining Interim Chancellor Koester?
 - The change in pattern is to encourage trustees to engage with the ASCSU but avoid operational aspects of the CSU. The Trustee role is at the level of policy and fiduciary duty plus planning and hiring of campus presidents and CSU CO leadership.
 - The overlay with the Trustees has led to expanded time allocation (given joint status)
- Enrollment
 - Enrollment is down. This appears to be a unique experience for the CSU in that it is systemic and exceptionally large (7% under enrollment vis-à-vis the system target).
 - The compact specifies an enrollment target that the CSU cannot meet (2022-23). This is an immediate potential fiscal problem regarding ongoing funding.
 - CSU campuses and their auxiliaries base their budgets on expected enrolments that they may not be meeting and thus may have over-spent regarding inputs.
 - California legislature is particularly focused on the CSU.
 - Most of the Northern California campuses have experienced significant enrollment drops (Humboldt, Sacramento, Sonoma, San Francisco, plus Channel Islands) – enrollment plans have been asked for. There will be some CSU CO support but there will be fiscal consequences for under-enrollment.
 - Interim Chancellor Koester believes that the CO will need to become an enrollment management agent.
 - California Community College (CCC) transfers to the CSU is down; CCC enrollment is also down – this suggests a structural problem for future CSU enrollment.

- **Comment:** Full-Time Equivalent Students (FTES) or headcount (FTES determines “enrollment”)
- **Comment:** summer courses (if not state support) do not count for FTES counts.
- **Comment:** AB 927 redirects some % of students from pursuing a 4-year degree from the CSU to the CCC.
- **Comment:** Arizona State University, Western Governors University, and other online opportunities are mining students from California (this leads to a reduction in resources for the CSU). [discussion of Southwest Educational Research Association membership]
- **Comment:** Recruitment vs. retention of CSU students (juniors and seniors are particular sources of retention drops) – CSU CO has asked each campus to have a contact person for retention (cross-cutting divisional responsibilities)
- **Comment:** How can campuses in the north work collaboratively to help address the enrollment crisis (esp. regarding online offerings)
- **Comment:** Student withdrawals have increased dramatically, the #1 reason is taking too high of a workload (esp. given entering knowledge reduction under COVID). This relates to trade-offs between course-taking patterns and employment/income demands.
- Graduation Initiative (GI) 2025 does support higher course-taking patterns because most students can handle that load.

Trustees Leslie Gilbert-Lurie, Jose Antonio Vargas, Jean P. Firstenberg, and Interim CSU Chancellor Jolene Koester, (Thursday)

- There will be a discussion of the plans for a “regular” Chancellor at the next Board meeting. The process will be inclusive of stakeholders but will be run in a similar fashion (closed search) as typically adopted for presidential searches.
- Update on Title IX efforts – Leora Freedman will be meeting with the Senate on Friday. It is clear that an increase in staffing is needed, some may need Managerial Personnel Plan (MPP) growth.
 - **Comment:** Cozen O’Conner intimated that they might revisit some campuses, this may or may not be in the cards. Can we facilitate faculty engagement beyond the implementation assessment visit that has already occurred.
 - **Comment:** kudos to the efforts of the CSU CO leadership on Title IX that go well beyond legalistic requirements and into cultural change. Trustee Firstenberg commented on the desire for us to work together to address the concerns of faculty, staff, and the board. Trustee Gilbert-Lurie also commented that student needs include mental health and other long-term support strategies. Experiences of the past shape our current experiences (Chancellor Koester reflected on her own experiences as a faculty member, Chair, Provost, and President in a different time and a request to allow us,

as an organization, to not let past failures prevent us from adopting new expectations).

- What follows GI 2025 (there is a Chancellor's Strategic workgroup that will bring a suggestion out to the stakeholders)
 - **Comment:** better shared governance practices would be involved from the origins.
 - **Comment:** Student Financial Aid limitations hold some students from graduation.
- Budget for legislative advocacy – CSU trustees operating budget request (established at the September Board meeting) – this will frame the advocacy efforts of the CSU. The new September budget request was positively received. CSU is appreciative of the 5% addition, CSU has staff and faculty salary deficits (see Mercer report, item 9.8)
 - **Comment:** have thoughts been generated regarding a more predictable salary schedule?
 - **Response:** the "sustainable funding model strategic workgroup" may address this.
 - **Comment:** question regarding cost of instructional materials (reduction of 50% as legislative goal)
- **ASCSU question:** AB 928 requires a singular pathway; what is the plan going forward out of the CSU CO?
 - **Response:** Faculty have primacy over the curriculum.
- **ASCSU question:** What is the goal of the Board for the 2022-23 year?
 - Trustee Firstenberg: Searching for a new Chancellor is the big item; losing a Chancellor was traumatic. Interim Chancellor Koester and Board Chair Fong have been an effective partnership. Board is now forward-looking.
 - Trustee Vargas: The personal goal is to understand the scope of the CSU – the education required, and commitment needed, to be an effective Trustee is large. Understanding equity and what that means for the CSU to be a national leader in immigrant opportunity is a personal goal.
 - Trustee Gilbert-Lurie: the next year is about stabilization (beyond the term of Chancellor Koester), we need to set the CSU up for future successes and have the CSU understood to be the best place for our students to go and succeed.

Charles Toombs – California Faculty Association (CFA) Liaison Report (Thursday)

- CFA will pursue (late May re-opener) having CFA and CSU look at Collective Bargaining Agreement (CBA) Articles 31 (salary), 20 (workload), 23 (Leaves of absence with pay – parental leave, e.g.), and 37 (Health and Safety)
- Campus chapters are working to ensure campus administration follows the CBA.

- Campus chapters are working to pursue some campus-based salary increases (following San Diego State University model), hiring of lecturers into tenured positions, and mental health counsellors hiring needs.
- Title IX
 - ex-Chancellor Castro as faculty at CSU San Luis Obispo
 - Cozen O'Conner Implementation survey is underway, CFA is pushing for a legislative investigation
- Far-right student groups are becoming an issue given targeting of administrators, faculty, staff, and/or students. There are CFA concerns about using police as first responders when such events occur.
 - Free-speech vs. hate speech boundaries (relates to safety concerns)
 - CFA is dedicated to looking at anti-black racism
- Tenure routes for professors of practice (possible job classification changes)
- **Comment:** Concerns about violations of unit 3 protections for faculty
- **Comment:** Racial and gender equity in bargaining
- **Comment:** benefits (reduction in options based on what is offered by the providers)
- **Comment:** cost of living adjustments as a proportion of new salary funds would be welcome.

Dixie Samaniego (California State Student Association Vice President of Systemwide Affairs) CSSA Liaison Report (Thursday)

- Heading to CSU Fresno for the CSSA plenary shortly.
- CSSA 2023 [policy agenda](#):
 - **Priority 1:** address the total cost of attendance for students
 - **Priority 2:** Ensure students have access to high quality wellness and mental health support services
 - **Priority 3:** Ensure the academic success and holistic educational experience of all CSU students
 - **Priority 4:** foster inclusive engagement for students to find agency in their campus.
 - Includes "mental health"
 - Includes "food and housing insecurity"
 - Includes "cost of attendance" – scholarship displacement concerns
 - Includes "support services"
 - Need for wrap-around services
 - Need to understand university processes.
 - Need for faculty / coursework flexible timelines
 - Open Education Resources (OER)/reduced-cost materials

Jerry Schutte – CSU-Emeritus and Retired Faculty & Student Association (csu-ERFSA) Report (Thursday)

- New Executive Director
 - Increased membership noted
 - Membership at half-cost for the immediate future
 - Matching funds for 503c donations
 - Medical group walked away from an almost complete negotiated solution; new lawsuit trial date is being established.
 - CALPERS retiree seat 2nd position was close, there is a November 4 - December 5 runoff election.
 - Faculty Early Retirement Program (FERP) pay for COVID (CSU CO & CFA were asked to jointly work to address possible backpay)
 - ERFSA newsletter has useful information on setting up retirement structures (403b vs. 401k, etc.)

Sylvia Alva, Executive Vice Chancellor of Academic and Student Affairs (Thursday)

- **Topics:**
 - First meeting of the AB 928 Associate Degree for Transfer (ADT) advocacy committee
 - How do we support the work of ensuring a smooth and direct transfer pathway?
 - First meeting was largely reviewing the charge
 - The Cal-GETC proposal is separate from but impacts the work of the AB 928 ADT committee
- The SB 1440 Faculty Discipline Review Group committees in Engineering / Science, Technology, Engineering, & Mathematics (STEM) could not build an ADT offering that fit the strictures of SB 1440 – the AB 928 committee will look at what might be required to allow ADTs for STEM, etc. (it is important that the faculty drive the proposals)
- A request was made to have CSU faculty (with or without their University of California and CCC colleagues) make recommendations prior to any action/work by the AB 928 ADT advocacy committee.
- There was discussion of the artificiality of the unit limits imposed by the CSU.
 - Black Student Success Group (CSU CO action)
- Leaning into equity gaps for historically underserved students
 - Last legislative cycle supported 9M dollars to examine Asian American and Native American Pacific Islander-Serving Institutions (AANAPISI) success.
 - Independent Doctoral Programs
 - ASCSU resolution forthcoming on doctoral programs (authorization)
 - The Doctorate of Public Health was **-not-** a slam dunk; this telegraphs that expansion of offerings needs to be well-considered and well-supported. No new state revenue is committed to these degrees and

- there are limits on tuition charged (and the converse that relying on higher tuition closes some doors for students)
 - Generically for 'any' professional doctorates?
 - Expansion of Doctorate of Education (Ed.D.)? (from K-12 leadership)
 - Ph.D. joint doctorate with non-California agencies?
 - Ph.D. for non-University of California (UC) degrees?
- Support for establishing the ASCSU JEDI committee.
- 4th year of math/QR as a high school requirement will be presented to the Board at its November
- **Comment:** NDRC report (on K-12 4th year QR) was completed 2 weeks ago, but thus far APEP had not received the report.
- **Comment:** CSU Online Course Offerings (as touted in the COMPACT)
- The 19 elements in the COMPACT might be a good topic for a future discussion

Leora Freedman, Acting Vice Chancellor for Human Resources: CSU Systemwide Title IX & Discrimination, Harassment, and Retaliation (DHR) Assessment Update (Friday)

- Overview of the Cozen O'Conner process
 - Campus reports started as implementation surveys/overviews to determine how current cases are being (or have been) processed (e.g., timeline)
 - Will not address individual personnel and/or single-case concerns in isolation.
 - Are being modified to allow greater faculty and student inputs (outside of the original "implementer" focus)
 - The first set of campus reports (n=14) will likely be available by December, with priority to the three campuses being audited first.
 - **Comment:** it would be good to regularly meet with a sub-set of the faculty of the ASCSU around our committee meetings to get input for ongoing system summaries and/or reports to better highlight issues of relevance to faculty.
- **Comment:** it would be desirable to have faculty be consulted or aware of any possible disciplinary action (e.g., letters or concern or reprimand) prior to the issuance of such letters.
- **Comment:** at least some Cozen visits do not have a lot of lead time for faculty engagement.

Mercer: Faculty Compensation Study Presentation (Friday) Lyn Harper (Mercer) & Al Liddicoat (CSU project team lead, Vice President for University and Chief Human Resources Officer at San Luis Obispo)]

- Project update and approach
- Project Planning
- Compensation market analysis
 - Collection of market data, etc. (e.g., by Carnegie class and also by the comparison institutions used for presidential peer comparisons)
 - Benchmarking (may vary by discipline [and non-instructional roles])
- Pay Compression, Inversion, Equity Analysis
- What is found to drive CSU salaries?
- Are there unexplained differences in compensation?
- These workstreams should run to completion in January/February (overall goal is March)
- Stakeholder Analysis, Communication, and Implementation.
- How are we steering the project with stakeholders?
- What is the process of acquiring feedback?
- <https://www.calstate.edu/csu-system/faculty-staff/faculty-compensation-study/Pages/stakeholders-focus-group-sessions.aspx>
- ***Comments***
 - CCC context may be somewhat unique to California
 - Historic inequities reflected in current retiree compensation
 - Lecturer-faculty vs. Tenure/Tenure-Track (T/TT) faculty.
 - Trust-building (what steps to disseminate outcomes and to ensure fairness what is reported)
 - There is great diversity across the context of the 23 CSU campuses.
 - Gender, ethnic, and racial disparities can propagate across time --- there is the opportunity for leadership/ professional development to mitigate these potentials. There are both systemic approaches (cf., San Luis Obispo processes) and individual training that can address such potential inequities.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS

Approved Resolutions

[AS-3567-22/FGA \(Rev\)](#) "Clarifying AB 927 in the Event of an Intersegmental Impasse"

Approved Without Dissent

[AS-3568-22/FA \(Rev\)](#) "The Role of Faculty in Protecting Fair Faculty Workload in the CSU"

Approved

[AS-3569-22/APEP \(Rev\)](#) "On the Intersegmental Committee of Academic Senates (ICAS) Cal-GETC Proposal: Action"

Approved

[AS-3570-22/FA \(Rev\)](#) "Requesting Extension of WSCUC Authorization of Remote Teaching to Spring 2023"

Approved

[AS-3571-22/APEP \(Rev\)](#) "Engaging Intersegmental Discussions Regarding College Preparatory Coursework in Mathematics (Area C)"

Approved

[AS-3572-22/FA/JEDI \(Rev\)](#) "Proclaiming the Personhood and Rights of Women"

Approved

[AS-3573-22/AA \(Rev\)](#) "To Adopt Gender-inclusive Language and Titles at the California State University"

Approved

[AS-3574-22/FA/EX \(Rev\)](#) "Reaffirming the Role of Campus Faculty Senates in the California State University (CSU)"

Approved

[AS-3575-22/FA \(Rev\)](#) "Provision of Free Condoms to Students on California State University (CSU) Campuses"

Approved

[AS-3576-22/FA \(Rev\)](#) "Request for Ongoing Accommodations and Flexibility in the Time of COVID-19"

Approved

[AS-3577-22/JEDI/FA \(Rev\)](#) "Support for Evaluating the CSU Course Equity Portal"

Approved

First Reading

The following resolutions were presented for feedback from Senators and communication to campuses. The sponsoring committee(s) will revise these resolutions and introduce them for action at the March 2023 plenary.

[AS-3578-22/JEDI](#) "Expansion of California State University (CSU) Independent Doctoral Degree Programs"

[AS-3579-22/FGA](#) "Funding Academic Senate CSU Summer Legislative Specialist Advocacy Work"

[AS-3580-22/FA](#) "Request for Increased Ventilation and Air Purification Infrastructure Across the California State University (CSU) System" [First Reading]

[AS-3581-22/JEDI/FA](#) "Adopting a Font Designed for Readability for California State University (CSU) Business"

[AS-3582-22/FA](#) "In Solidarity with the Courageous Iranian Women and Girls, Abroad and Locally"

AS-3583-22/EX "In Support of Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act (NAGRPA) Compliance in the California State University (CSU)"

AS-3584-22/FA "Establishing Timely Responses to Legislative Resolutions from Campus Senates"

AS-3585-22/JEDI/FA/FGA "CSU Employee Justice Equity and Diversity Housing Assistance Program"

AS-3586-22/JEDI/FA "Systemic Inclusion of Preferred Names and Pronouns within the California State University (CSU) System"

ADJOURNMENT