

**ASCSU Plenary Minutes**  
**November 14-15, 2019**  
**CSU Office of the Chancellor**

**Thursday**, November 14, 2019 – 8:00 a.m. TO 5:00 p.m. - Dumke Auditorium

**Thursday**, November 14, 2019 – 12:00 noon TO 1:00 p.m.

**Friday**, November 15, 2019 - 8:00 a.m. to 3:00 p.m. - Dumke Auditorium

**ROLL CALL**

(CSU Bakersfield) Millar, Tarjan; (CSU Channel Islands) Grzegorzczuk, Yudelson; (CSU Chico) Boyd, Ford; (CSU Dominguez Hills) Celly, Norman; (CSU East Bay) Glass, Wu; (CSU Fresno) Jenkins, Schlievert; (CSU Fullerton) Matz, Stambough, Stohs; (Humboldt State) Creadon, Zerbe; (CSU Long Beach) Janousek, Klink, Soni; (CSU Los Angeles) Bezdecny, Riggio; (CSU Maritime Academy) Browne, Trevisan; (CSU Monterey Bay) Lopez-Littleton, Waltz; (CSU Northridge) Ricks, Schutte, Sussman; (CSPU Pomona) Speak, Urey; (CSU Sacramento) Hamilton, Holl; (CSU San Bernardino) Steffel, Ullman; (San Diego State) Butler-Byrd, Csomay, Ornatowski; (San Francisco State) Collins, Yee-Melichar; (San José State) Curry, Rodan, Van Selst; (CPSU San Luis Obispo) Laver, Rein; (CSU San Marcos) Barsky, Basu; (Sonoma State) Nelson, Reeder; (CSU Stanislaus) Filling, Strahm; (CSU ERFSA) Pasternack

**CALL TO ORDER**

With a quorum being present, the meeting was called to order.

**APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

Approved

**APPROVAL OF SEPTEMBER 19-20, 2019 MINUTES**

Moved, Seconded and Approved.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

There will be a social this evening, in the Wallace pre-function area, hosted by the Academic Affairs Committee

**PRESENTATIONS/INTRODUCTIONS**

- Zoom Livestream/Recording
  - Motion passed to allow Zoom video/audio recording for this plenary and to discuss future plenaries at our January meeting

## REPORTS

### Chair

- **November 2019**
  - Welcome to the November 2019 Plenary, colleagues! As our October Interim Meeting was October 25, this report will briefly update you on the major issues that continue to occupy our collective time and attention.
- **Search for a New Chancellor**
  - Vice Chair Collins and I attended the first two open forums designed to gather feedback on what CSU colleagues want to see in a new chancellor. The first was at Sacramento State on Tuesday, November 12 at CSU Sacramento and the second at CSU East Bay today, November 13. I'd guess maybe 100+ people attended both. We heard from staff, faculty, students, union representatives and administrators. Students were particularly well represented at the East Bay discussion.
  - The major themes raised so far include: collaboration as a core value; a good cultural fit with the CSU; respect for shared governance and academic freedom; experience in a collective bargaining environment; someone who will work well with the legislature and administration; knowledge of California and California higher education; someone from inside the CSU; someone who reflects the demographics of our students and understands the need for faculty/staff who reflect our student demographic; the importance of the student-faculty relationship to student success; commitment to sustainability at the system and campus level; outreach to communities outside the university; attention to students' basic needs; importance of food and housing insecurity and mental health needs (and the companion need for a much better student-counselor ratio); protection for DACA students and undocumented students, faculty and staff; the need for affordable faculty/staff housing; and concern about the lack of specifically labor representation on the advisory committee.
  - There are four open forums left. You can find the schedule, watch via livestream, watch archived video, provide feedback and even nominate someone for the position on the search website at: <https://www2.calstate.edu/cs-system/chancellor/chancellor-search>
  - Please feel free to contact Vice Chair Collins and me with feedback at any time as well.
- **ASCSU Travel Budget**
  - The Executive Committee was asked to provide a report on our travel budget for 2019-20. As you recall, we were provided with an additional \$50,000 in our budget to cover travel costs. ASCSU Director Tracy Butler has provided us with the following information.

- There are still outstanding travel claims from 2018-19, but Director Butler estimates that last year we spent \$172,000 on travel. We also carried forward a cumulative deficit of approximately \$49,500 from 2017-18 to 2018-19. Because of the added \$50,000 this year we were able to bring all campuses “into the green,” with approximately \$24,500 cumulatively left at the campuses at the end of the 2018-19 year (about \$1,000 for each campus). That cushion will cover actual claim amounts that might have gone over our estimate for a given Senator, or any other claims that are still outstanding. Director has budgeted \$190,000 (about a 10% increase) for next year.
- There are also several parameters we adhere to, based upon CSU travel policy and our own practices under that policy, that keep us within budget. We fund first year senators’ travel to plenary meetings. We fund second year and beyond senators travel to standing committee and plenary meetings and systemwide taskforce/committee meetings when Zoom isn’t appropriate. CSU travel policy also requires that anyone who lives, or works on a CSU campus located within 25 miles of the CO) receive funding for daily travel, but not for overnight travel. Whichever location is closest to the CO is used as the baseline. Historically, the Executive Committee has approved exceptions when a disability may affect length/duration of travel; long distance or a departure time (e.g. 2:00 or 3:00 a.m.) prevents colleagues from getting to the CO for a morning meeting (typically northern campuses Humboldt and Chico); as needed for ASCSU leadership (Executive Committee, Standing Committee Chairs) as increased workload demands night before arrival or flexibility in availability; and natural disasters or unforeseen events (earthquake, fires, live shooter at LAX a few years ago). In all these circumstances a justification and paper trail are required for an exception.
- **Ethnic Studies**
  - Academic Affairs Chair Susan Schlievert sent out AA’s draft resolution on an ethnic studies requirement this evening (Wednesday). Chair Schlievert tells me that two of our Ethnic Studies Council colleagues consulted with AA in the effort. Chair Schlievert will update us in more detail tomorrow.
- **Quantitative Reasoning**
  - See the BOT Educational Policy Committee agenda for changes in the proposed CSU 4<sup>th</sup> year of quantitative reasoning proposal. Major changes include postponing a BOT vote until January 2020 and extended the effective date to Fall 2027.

### Standing committees

- **Academic Affairs (AA) – Susan Schlievert, Chair**

- AA met until 6:30 p.m. last night. We had a packed agenda, guest speakers, and wonderful discussions.
  - We discussed the Community College Baccalaureate degree pilot program (AVC Alison Wrynn offered her insights and clarifications), the COs collection of campus ethnic studies activities, increasing communication within the ASCSU, recommendations for the Thursday evening socials, and ethnic studies.
  - Thank you to Senator Schutte for joining us to discuss the state legislature, their procedures, and AB 1460. His knowledge of the workings of our state government is so valuable and appreciated.
  - We were joined yesterday via Zoom by Dr. Mark Wicklund from Humboldt, an assessment and learning outcomes specialist. He assisted us with concrete, measurable outcomes for our resolution--very helpful and collaborative. He had joined our outcomes sub group on Sunday, too, as had Dr. Maulana Karenga. Dr. Kenneth Monteiro and Dr. Karenga joined us for our Tuesday sub group meeting. We wanted collaboration with representatives from the Council on Ethnic Studies and are appreciative of their expertise and collegiality.
  - I sent you a draft of the ethnic studies resolutions last night. With the tight turn-around, we wanted to give you extra time to look over it. It was a draft, with special thanks to Senators Van Selst, Butler-Bird, and Csomay for their work.
  - Finally, I would like to acknowledge and thank committee members: from our volunteer Thursday Social shoppers (Senators Millar, Urey, and Celly), our Zoom work group, and all of the committee members present yesterday. They just “run with it” and get it done. Truly the best committee!

- **Academic Preparation & Education Programs (APEP) – Susan L Holl, Chair**

- Many thanks to the fabulous members of APEP, our Chancellor’s Office liaisons, Ed Sullivan and Marquita Grenot-Sheyer, and the invaluable help of Senator Van Selst.
  - We started our meeting with a pre-meeting with the WestEd team who are wrapping up their study of the implementation of EO 1110 during the 2018-19 academic year. They presented us with system level data regarding attempts and completion rates for all four categories of first-year students in both A2 and B4 courses. They will be finishing a report on this study early next year. We also had a robust discussion with Ed Sullivan about the system level data.

- We spent much of our time on perfecting our resolution on **INCREASING ACCESS, SUCCESS AND COMPLETION THROUGH ADDITIONAL PREPARATION IN QUANTITATIVE REASONING** to bring back to the plenary later this meeting. Additionally, we discussed other matters of interest to APEP but are in a wait and watch mode until our next plenary so we will not be bringing any additional resolutions to this plenary.
- **Faculty Affairs (FA) - Steven Filling, Chair**
  - Faculty Affairs, as always, had a day full of thoughtful discussions. You will see three of the issues we discussed on our agenda
    - Item 9.1 - Notification of Tenure-track Openings to Incumbent Faculty, Librarians, Coaches and Counselors [second reading]
    - Item 9.3 Land Acknowledgement [second reading]and
    - Item 9.8 Creating a Holistic and Humane Educational Environment in the California State University [first reading]
    - More on those items when we get to them.
    - Our CO liaison, AVC Ganesh Raman, shared the presentation on Research in the CSU that he will be delivering to the Board next week. This sparked a discussion about research in the CSU and how we might better communicate with Trustees about research activities. We believe our discussion will influence future communications with the Board.
    - With respect to the issue of preferred pronouns and names on class rosters - we are continuing to talk with AVC Raman about the issues involved and the CO has scheduled a webinar on implementation of this on 21 November.
    - On counsel of the Executive Committee and our Parliamentarian, Faculty Affairs has established a Working Group on Green Open Access Policy. The working group will include
      - FA members Kris Bezdecny and Vanessa Lope-Littleton, Librarian Mark Bilby from Fullerton, possibly another librarian, AVC Raman, a representative from the Office of General Counsel, and a Library Dean from the Council of Library Directors. We anticipate that the working group will conclude its work before May 2020.
    - We talked at length about public comment limitations at Board of Trustees meetings. We are working on a resolution addressing both the issue of public comment and on enhancing faculty communication with the Board.
    - Faculty Affairs also talked at length about the possibility of having dedicated seats at ASCSU for non tenure track faculty. This is obviously a

complex issue that would have impacts in a variety of places, and we will be exploring those impacts further in future meetings.

- Finally, we devoted some time to exploring the feasibility of term limits for ASCSU Senators. As you might imagine, this is a topic that all have opinions on, and we will be continuing that discussion in future meetings.
- As always, thanks to Vice Chair Yudelson for his continuing work recording our deliberations and to the entire committee for their active and thoughtful participation in our dialogues.

- **Fiscal & Governmental Affairs (FGA) - David Speak, Chair**

- The Fiscal and Governmental Affairs Committee has been busy since our last plenary session in September, and virtual session in October, with a full day of intense and productive conversation yesterday. Our work is important, our dedication to it is complete, our report succinct:

- Thanks to Legislative Specialist, Senator Schutte, there is, attached to my chair's report, a summary of the current state of the legislation on which the ASCSU took positions last year. In all, the outcomes were quite positive. Remembering that we're talking about correlation, not causation, 11 outcomes out of 12 that have been fully resolved are congruent with the positions taken by this body last March. A few notes about some of the other 10: the 2 bills attempting to increase the availability of mental health counselors on campus are held up, primarily due to funding questions. The two bond bills have been abandoned in favor of the larger bond measure that includes K-12 and will add the strength of the CTA to advocacy efforts in the statewide election.

And then there's AB1460. It would be hard to define precisely the current state of AB1460 except to say it's still alive and still the object of a lot of effort here in ASCSU. FGA has consulted with AA concerning the resolution that will be before the body during this session.

- FGA brings to the full body a resolution concerning the budget proposal of the trustees, and asks for a first reading waiver. Generally supportive, the resolution includes muscular language urging a larger compensation pool than is being proposed.
- The FGA chair and Legislative Specialist are engaged in planning for a December 10 advocacy trip to Sacramento with ASCSU chair Nelson and Vice Chair Collins. The hope is to continue to make progress on AB1460 but also to 'work' the rest of ASCSU's legislative and fiscal agenda with members of the legislature, the Department of Finance and the LAO.
- In committee we are continuing our conversation about how best to engage individual members of the legislature in their home districts, and will count on the assistance of every senator in that effort as we move forward.

- When policy wonks gather, are they having fun? We will let you know: we're working on definitional statement that lays out metrics for a quantitative determination of the question.

### **Romey Sabalius – CSU Faculty Trustee**

- On search committee for new CSU Chancellor
  - Will watch livestreams of several listening tour stops
- Appreciate ASCSU resolution on budget
- Budget request is large but good, especially for maintenance
  - Plan to request more money for compensation and benefits
- Fourth year Quantitative Reasoning Requirement
  - Sixth time of public debate will be happening at the BOT next week
  - Delayed decision until January
  - Changes have been made to the proposal
- Acquisition of Mission Valley property
- Executive Compensation
  - Discussion on policy to make salary adjustments on presidents during their reviews

### **Other committees and committee liaisons**

- **General Education Advisory Committee (GEAC)** - Mark Van Selst, Chair
  - Credit for prior learning
    - underlying concern re: CCC action is that GE credit by the CCC has to be approved by the CSU for systematic articulations but not for 'one off' substitutions into a complete GE package (or area certification). Current legislation and action need to be carefully tracked.
  - Ethnic Studies
    - there was an update to GEAC on current status and likely future ASCSU action (resolution from NOV ASCSU plenary will be distributed to GEAC)
  - Tracking CCC students post-transfer
    - there is an outstanding request (esp. re: b4) on student success post-transfer (not overall but by CCC experience)
  - CLEP Spanish with Writing
    - GEAC recommended treating this new (OCT/19) exam as CLEP Spanish
  - Campus-Based GE assessment practices
    - continued focus on assessment of GE as a whole package; questions of intentionality require additional follow-up.
  - Campus flexibility in GE
    - a good discussion, informed by the division in considerations in ASCSU consideration of ethnic studies between outcomes and implementation, is

to query ruling on EO1100 implementation as experienced on CSU campuses.

- Course Identification Numbering Project (C-ID)
  - Delay in CSU reviews for C-ID courses. There are several disciplines that have a large number or very much delayed reviews. If a CCC course is submitted to C-ID but is not reviewed in 45 days it is considered to be able to be counted as approved for the purposes of submitting and authorizing a CCC campus to offer an AA/T or AS/T. Although the course still does need to go through the review process long delays in reviews (esp. those that yield a negative determination) are problematic (see list below).
  - There is a question of what happens after a TMC gets updated (note that this is actually not strictly a C-ID issue but one for the Intersegmental Curriculum Workgroup). After a TMC undergoes a substantial update CSU campuses would need to redetermine compatibility and then there is the question of what happens to the "old" versus "new" program completers. To add further complexity, catalog rights and AA/T and AS/T processes do not fully interact.
- **Information Technology Advisory Committee (ITAC)** – ASCSU representative Senator Simon Rodan (San Jose)
  - MFA (Multi-Factor Authentication) is coming
  - Common HR System (CHRA)
- **Chancellor's Doctoral Incentive Policy Advisory and System-wide Selection Committees/Program**
  - Encourage people to apply
- **Academic Council on International Programs (ACIP)** - ASCSU Liaisons: Steve Browne and Eniko Csomay
  - ACIP met 24-25 October in the Chancellor's Office. The meeting was attended by campus international programs representatives and three students who had recently returned from CSU study abroad programs.
  - The council welcomed Dr. Jaishankar Raman as the new director of CSU International Programs, replacing AVC Van Cleve. Dr. Raman and CSU IP continue to report to AVC Van Cleve.
  - ACIP is planning the 2020 Faculty Seminar which will be in Germany in Summer 2020. This event will coincide with the 25<sup>th</sup> anniversary of CSU IP's partnership with Germany. It is an opportunity for CSU faculty to present their research and build relationships with partners overseas. Applications are due December 1, 2019, through the CSU IP Portal. Some travel funds will be available.
  - 23,000 CSU students have participated in CSU IP programs since its founding.
  - Student enrollment is up 10% compared to 2018-19.

- CSU IP's plans for 2019-2020
  - Visit as many CSU campuses as possible.
  - Assess CSU IP's partnerships and MOUs
  - Explore overseas teaching opportunities for CSU faculty
- CSU faculty may apply for Resident Director positions in France, Italy and Spain for 2020-21. These are 12-month appointments. Faculty must be fluent in the appropriate language. Applications are due December 1, 2019 through the CSU IP Portal.
- This year ACIP will review the programs in China, Chile and Taiwan.
- The program review of Canada was completed. Enrollment in that program is very low. ACIP will explore partnering with additional institutions in Canada. Expanded programs in England and Egypt will also be explored.

#### **SPEAKERS**

##### **Barry Pasternack – CSU-ERFSA President (Time Approximate: Thursday 10:00 a.m.)**

- The fall 2019 CSU ERFSA State Council Meeting was held on Oct. 5, 2019 on the M L King Library on the campus of SJSU. We had around 25 people in attendance including: current and past members of the ASCSU consisting of several past chairs, current and past members of the CSU Board of Trustees and retired members of the CalPERS Board, as well as retired campus Presidents other administrators. Trustee Romney Sabalius and CSSA Vice President Grace Pang were featured speakers.
- New members were appointed to the Legislative Committee, the Membership Committee, and the Grants Committee. The total amount for Grants this year will be up to \$7,000. A major topic of discussion was increasing membership. To that end, CSU ERFSA is working on a number of new benefits for members. These include: working with a major brokerage firm to provide our members free copies of the "Guide to Finances After 50" as well as incentives for opening accounts, and working with a travel company that can offer our members a 10% reduction on their offerings. We plan on contacting other providers of products and services that our members may find attractive. While these efforts should demonstrate the value of being a CSU ERFSA member, the real benefit is to ensure that our pension and health benefits are not threatened.

##### **Timothy P. White – CSU Chancellor (Time Certain: Thursday 11:00 a.m.)**

- **Budget Request**
  - Governor interested in one-time funding instead of recurring funding
    - Hedge for future recession
- **Questions/Comments**
  - Close to 18,000 contingent faculty/coachers/counselors/librarians, would you be supportive of a reduced research tenure-track faculty position?
    - Everyone has a full load, speak to strengths of each faculty member

- ~ Who does teaching, research, advising?
  - Set clear, fair, equitable expectations
- Is there a forthcoming Intellectual Property policy coming?
  - Will get an answer and respond back to the body
- Are graduation rates the right success measure? How will you set the culture in the CO that our students are not just data?
  - Plan to sprint across the finish line
  - We should measure what we value
  - If data emerges that we're working against our values, we will pay attention.
- Thank you for your service with aplomb
- We would welcome you to join CSU ERFSA.
  - When you get to the point where you think you want to retire, do it. Otherwise, you will regret burning the best years of the rest of your life.
- What is the CO's position and advice to the ASCSU on the Community College Baccalaureate Degrees and their review?
  - Good questions, not sure on data, especially for similar programs
  - In good economic times, community college attendance declines
    - ~ What economy declines, enrollment will go up
  - If California needs more baccalaureate degree holders, fund the CSU
  - Governor's Council on post-secondary education
    - ~ Representatives of public institutions and other, will focus on quality
- Concern about racist events on CSU campuses, what else can we do to ensure the safety of faculty, staff, and students in the CSU?
  - Two weeks don't go by when there isn't an incident that is against our values
    - ~ Cooperating reporting agencies has declined
    - ~ Until there is another election, we will continue to have issues with safety and racism
    - ~ Advice to us and successor is incredible vigilance, care, concern, and denounce incidents when they happen.
    - ~ Each campus has a preparedness group that is designed to have interdisciplinary members that are aware of potential precipitating events and managing them
- At recent GI 2025 Symposium, heard about graduation rates. As we continue to complete our undergraduate students, what will the CSU do for our graduate programs?
  - ~ Undergraduates apply to institutions
  - ~ Graduate students apply to programs/faculty

- Student died, don't know details, people are struggling with the loss, especially with the lack of information
  - ~ There are no suppression policies, a lot goes into trying to connect with the family and respecting their wishes
  - ~ Law enforcement needed to get involved, so suppression was necessary
  - ~ Had been alcohol-related issues associated with Greek fraternities in past
    - ❖ Potential expulsion if this is violated
  - ~ Goals before retirement
    - ❖ Fund CSU in next budget
    - ❖ Pass the General Obligation Bond
    - ❖ Redouble efforts to take care of DACA and Dreamers

**Kara Perkins, Executive Budget Director (Time Certain: Thursday 2:00 p.m.)**

See presentation attachment

**Charles Toombs - CFA Liaison Report (Time Approximate: Friday 9:30 a.m.)**

- Commend for working on Ethnic Studies Resolution
- Campus autonomy and concern for lack of knowledge of ethnic studies on the local level
- Advocated to CalPERS to not invest in for-profit prison systems
- Bargaining in spring
- Interested in new Chancellor process

**Jacquelyn Acosta - CSSA Liaison Report (Time Approximate: Friday 10:00 a.m.)**

- Messages about Quantitative Reasoning are inconsistent
  - Concerns about implementation timeline

**Michael Berman – CSU Chief Information Officer (Time Certain: Friday 10:30 a.m.)**

- CIO of CSU
- Run Peoplesoft
- Support Network infrastructure between campuses
- Commitment to Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion in IT
- Information Security
- Support for Advanced Computing Resources especially for undergraduate students

**Loren Blanchard, Executive Vice Chancellor of Academic and Student Affairs (Time Certain: Friday 11:00 a.m.)**

- 9% increase from 2017 students taking courses in Ethnic Studies
- hired 72 Ethnic Studies faculty across the CSU
- Preparing for next week's CSU Board of Trustees meeting

- Title 5 change related to student organizations
  - Can't discriminate based on any protected class
  - Make Title 5 have parity with other state policy
- Annual Report on research, scholarly, creative activities in the CSU
  - Including success on gaining grant funding
  - Focus on number of faculty members with powerful work
  - Update on Graduation Initiative 2025
    - ~ Sharing new graduation rates
    - ~ Equity gap is relatively constant because "all boats are rising"
      - ❖ Will eventually see results especially as related to academic preparation
      - ❖ 2-3 year lag in seeing results
  - Quantitative Reasoning proposal to address the equity gap
    - ~ Action item delayed until January meeting
    - ~ Have changed implementation date from six years to seven years
    - ~ Make sure schools in California are ready to offer additional courses
      - ❖ If any schools aren't able to meet requirement, students will automatically be exempted
    - ~ Additional investment in teacher preparation (from 1000 teachers to 2000 teachers)

#### **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS**

Notification of Tenure-track Openings to Incumbent Contingent Faculty, Librarians, Coaches & Counselors	<u>AS-3393-19/FA (Rev)</u> <b>REFERRED TO COMMITTEE</b>
Increasing Access, Success and Completion Through Additional Preparation in Quantitative Reasoning	<u>AS-3394-19/APEP (Rev)</u> <b>APPROVED</b>
Land Acknowledgement and Statement	<u>AS-3396-19/FA (Rev)</u> <b>APPROVED WITHOUT DISSENT</b>
Support for the California State University (CSU) Board of Trustees (BOT) Proposed 2020-21 Operating Budget Request	<u>AS-3402-19/FGA</u> <b>APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY</b>

**THE FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS WERE INTRODUCED FOR FIRST READING  
CONSIDERATION:**

Recommended Implementation of an Ethnic Studies System Requirement AS-3403-19/AA  
Creation of Ad Hoc Committee to Advance Equity, Diversity and AS-3404-19/EX  
Inclusion Within the Academic Senate CSU  
Creating a Holistic and Humane Educational Environment in the AS-3405-19/FA  
California State University (CSU)

**THE FOLLOWING RESOLUTION WAS WITHDRAWN:**

Developing a System-wide Understanding of CSU Actions and AS-3401-19/AA (Rev)  
Plans Relating to the Ethnic Studies Task Force Report

***NOTE:** Resolution number AS-3395-19 was not assigned to a resolution during the September plenary.  
This will be noted in the record and on the website.*

**ADJOURNMENT**

*Respectfully submitted by Beth A. Steffel (San Bernardino), ASCSU Secretary*