

Academic Senate CSU (ASCSU)

401 Golden Shore, Suite 243
Long Beach, CA 90802-4210

Beth A. Steffel, Chair

Phone: 909-781-1820
E-mail: bsteffel@csusb.edu

www.calstate.edu/csu-system/faculty-staff/academic-senate

**ASCSU Plenary Minutes
March 16-17, 2023
Office of the Chancellor (Hybrid)**

Thursday, March 16, 2023, 8 AM - 12:30 PM, 1 - 5 PM

- **Thursday**, March 16, 2023, 12:30 PM - 1:00 PM New Senator Orientation
- **Thursday**, March 16, 2023, 5:15 PM - 6:30 PM Senate Social (first floor meeting rooms at the Office of the Chancellor and

Friday, March 17, 2023, 8 AM Faculty Trustee Interviews and Voting (only Senators and Trustee Candidates)

- **Friday**, March 17, 2023, ~9:30 AM - 5 PM

[Interruption Statement](#)

CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

ROLL CALL

Senators: Kevin Baaske, David Barsky, Kris Bezdecny, Stephanie Burkhalter, Elizabeth Boyd, Nola Butler-Byrd, Paul Carpenter, Robert Collins, Eniko Csomay, Steven Filling, Rick Ford, Nancy Gerber, Carolyn Gibbs, Mark Groen, Tabitha Hart/Reiko Kataoka (Th/Fr substitutes for Julia Curry), Tracy Hamilton, Christine Isakson, Kelly Janousek, Michael Jenkins, Kristi Kanel, Eileen Klink, Gary Laver, Ryne Leuzinger, Janet Millar, Michael Milligan, Monty Mola, Dana Nakano, Elaine Newman, Thomas Norman, Michelle Ramos Pellicia, Monica Pereira; Steve Rein, Boris Ricks, Simon Rodan, Susan Schlievert, Jerry Schutte, Richard Senghas, Jason Shepard, Beth Steffel, Praveen Soni, Elizabeth Sussman-Dabach, Adam Swenson, Laura Talamante, William Tsai, Gwen Urey, Kristen Van Gaasbeck, Mark Van Selst, Nicholas Von Glahn, Scott Waltz, Greg Wood, Meiling Wu-Winiarski, Darlene Yee-Melichar

Invited Guests / Others: Romey Sabalius (Faculty Trustee); Charles Toombs (CFA); Brent Foster (CSU CO); Jeanne Tran-Martin (CSU CO); Jeni Kitchell (CSU CO); Leslie Kennedy (CSU CO); Jolene Koester (Interim Chancellor, CSU CO); Wenda Fong (Chair, Board of Trustees); Lateefah Simon (CSU Board of Trustees); Thomas Parham (CSU Dominguez Hills President); Sylvia Alva (Executive Vice Chancellor, CSU CO); Dixie Samaniego (CSSA); Ed Sullivan (CSU CO); Al Liddicoat (CSU); Tracy Butler (ASCSU Director); Reem Osman (ASCSU Administrative Support)

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

1. Edits to withdraw APEP item on modality (AS-3589-23/APEP now withdrawn)
2. Edits to ADD waiver item (JEDI)
3. Edits to ADD 6 first reading items (2 AA, 2 FA, 2 JEDI)
4. Approved

APPROVAL OF THE JANUARY 19-20, 2023, MINUTES

Approved

ANNOUNCEMENTS

None

PRESENTATIONS/INTRODUCTIONS

None

REPORTS

Academic Senate CSU Chair's Report

Standing committees

1. Faculty Affairs (FA – Kristine Bezdecny, Chair)
2. Fiscal and Governmental Affairs (FGA – Steven Rein, Chair)
3. Academic Preparation and Educational Programs (APEP – Tracy Hamilton, Chair)
4. Academic Affairs (AA – Simon Rodan, Chair)
5. Justice, Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion (JEDI - Nola Butler-Byrd, Chair)
6. General Education Advisory Committee (GEAC – Eniko Csomay, Chair)
7. CSU Faculty Trustee – Romey Sabalius
 - 7.1 Q&A on presidential appointments
 - Interim Presidential appointments (multiple alternatives presented to board)
 - Duration of interim/permanent Presidential appointments
 - Considerations in presidential selections
 - 7.2 Q&A on possible faculty salary increase/decrease in purchasing power (Reference to Board of Trustees budget request)
 - 7.3 Comment on CA budget process and how CSU/UC is fairing.
8. Legislative Specialists – Christine Isakson / Jerry Schutte
 - 8.1 Supplementary summary (from legislative council digest) and descriptions of positions were shared by both FA and the Leg. Specialist reports.
 - 8.2 Budget issues are a concern for both CA (24B deficit) and the CSU in particular (about half of budget request was honored, but still better than most agencies in CA)

- 8.3 Advocacy efforts will be to focus on the multiplier effect that monies sent to the CSU provide (vs. prisons or other budget items).
- 8.4 Better coordination w/ CFA and CSU.
- 8.5 Bills of special interest to the ASCSU (some are of lesser interest given their likelihood of passage) are:
 - AB 506 California Community College (CCC) involvement in what counts for CSU Ethnic Studies
 - AB 640 unionized support workers
 - AB 1390 service learning
- 8.6 ASCSU will need to be more heavily involved in advocacy for bill amendments
- 8.7 AB 485 is a clean-up bill to AB 89 (modern policing degree) – clean-up is to move requirement for a 4-year degree and a 2-year degree to require either 4-year or 2-year degree;
- 8.8 Concern about AB 1390 (Service Learning for all students), in addition to risk-related issues, AB 1390 is an unfunded requirement and imposition on CSU curriculum

SPEAKERS / DISCUSSION

- 1. **Sylvia Alva**, Executive Vice Chancellor of Academic and Student Affairs
 - 1.1 **Vaccination policy** (students) is silent on COVID – there is a California law that requires vaccination for California high school attendance. the CSU updated our policies to require proof of vaccination for CSU students. Eighteen years of age or younger require hepatitis B vaccination; student notification requirements for Mononucleosis etc. (vaccine is not required). CSU have moved policy 803 to recommended vs. required (this now avoids the policy requirement that student registration be blocked). On COVID, prior CSU policy required vaccination. The CSU is now pursuing a more relaxed (recommended vs. required) system policy requirement. Campuses can pursue more restrictive policies for both COVID and other vaccinations in dorm or specific learning settings (done in consultation with the CSU Chancellor's Office).
 - 1.2 **AB 927**. CCC baccalaureate degrees. The law stipulates that the CCC degrees cannot overlap with CSU degrees. CCC actions to authorize a degree over objections of the CSU are concerning (the specific example: Fire Science degree at Feather River College). How to build a system to resolve the impasse. Legal remedies were encouraged by the ASCSU. The need to nip degree overlap issues in the bud is paramount. The violation of intersegmental respect produces additional concerns about the impact on future interactions and potentials for collaborations. CSU degrees are statewide degrees. Workforce needs can be recognized but regionality is not part of the definition.

- Definition of duplication
 - Curriculum (names)
 - Pedagogy (content) – the content can lead to duplicative content even though the names of the degrees might be different from those in the CSU
- **Comment:** (cf., cyber-defense trying to encroach into cyber-security [conceptually is a degree in “ancient Greek history” not fundamentally a “history” degree]).
- ASCSU actions: June 2021, our letter of opposition “the expectation of consensus” and our ASCSU resolution [AS-3569-22/APEP \(Rev\)](#).
- Process of consultation as used by CCC “timely consultation” is a checkbox item for the CCCs rather than seeking genuine consultation (e.g., 3-4 days’ notice for a ‘consultation’ meeting)
- 30-days’ notice (per AB 927) – to identify the requisite groups/faculty and building a feedback mechanism that could respond appropriately within the timeline is problematic.
- CCC police science degrees will be another issue (one of the largest degree offerings in the CSU and/or a very high percentage of California graduates are from the CSU)

1.3 **AB 928 / Cal-GETC**

- Executive Vice Chancellor Alva suggests movement towards CSU General Education (GE) to align with Cal-GETC. ASCSU concerns include: the inadvisability of making CSU GE require University of California (UC) eligibility requirements. The movement of curriculum outside of CSU control; the fact that multiple GE patterns have always (and will continue) to exist; catalog rights; the cost of any change; difficulties in awarding Associate Degrees for Transfer (ADTs) if it can vary by UC vs. CSU version of Cal-GETC.

1.4 **Service learning** – deep concerns remain about the cost of potential legislation that might require service learning as a CSU graduation requirement.

2. **Thomas A. Parham**, President of CSU Dominguez Hills

- 2.1 **Thank you** to Senators Butler-Byrd and Thomas Norman regarding invitation to address the ASCSU.
- 2.2 **Topic:** the intention is to talk about the critical role the ASCSU has in addressing Black student success. Strengths and challenges regarding unwelcoming environments on CSU campuses. Addressing interventions that might be effective.
 - *GOAL 1:* be provocative
 - *GOAL 2:* energize regarding synthesis of the sobering message and motivation to engage in change

- *GOAL 3:* encourage ASCSU representatives to commit to make a single change in behavior regarding contributing to student success.

2.3 **The talk:**

- One can evaluate the importance of an item to a body by the time spent on the issue – to what extent is the success of black students a priority for the CSU and of the ASCSU?
- The CSU claims to be student-centered but there is incongruence between some behaviors and our claims. Does the CSU produce an education that supports the personal growth and development of all our students?
- Reluctant leadership: The mission can drive the behavior. How do we get out of our administrative heads and engage in work that transforms lives.
- An individual is only as important as their contribution to the tribe.
- What are the metrics that we aspire to (50% graduation rate, 0% equity gap)? We need to set the priorities to reflect what we want to see.
- Leading with love and not fear
- “Give me not 8 reasons why not, give me two reasons why...”
- Identity development:
 - What does integrity look like in the face of oppression?
 - What does truth look like in the face of deception?
 - What does leadership look like in the face of opportunity and challenge?
 - What is the relationship between the promise of higher education and the experience of our students? (Aspirational desire vs recognized reality of lived experience)
- Where do we (CSU) go from here moving forward?
 - Assert dignity and worth,
 - Organize strengths into power,
 - Focus on action (vs. philosophy),
 - Expectation of equality despite inequity (divine dissatisfaction).
- How to move to greater congruence between goals and practice.
- What are we doing to excite or make our system appealing to our under-represented students (avoiding imposter syndrome) – how to get students to the resources that they need.
- Intentional recruitment across disciplines
- Differential support to welcome and support faculty, what is the institution doing to build cohorts and support groups? How does the campus strengthen the cross-cultural bias sensitivity of non-black non-latinx faculty?

- What are the administrative barriers to academic success and what are the attributions that we make regarding student success (and lack thereof).
- **Comment:** Appreciate your coming out to the ASCSU and appreciate your speech
- **Question:** What is the next operational project for the CSU if you were to give guidance for us?
 - **Answer:** let's clean up what is still in the work... let's remove classroom toxicity, let's address attributional labels/attitudes. Simple action – just greet each other well ("*good day, I respect your humanity and respect your success*"). Student success in COVID shows weaknesses in the system, not the students.
- **Comment:** Concerns voiced about losing role models for our students (toxicity, sustained support, etc.)
- **Comment:** Lifelong learning (humility, respect, cultural sensitivity) being lost due to legislative interference (the loss of soft skills)
- Circumstances are where people come from, not who they are.

3. **Jolene Koester**, Interim CSU Chancellor

3.1 California Community Colleges (CCC) Board of Governors approved a 4-year degree program (Feather River, Fire Science) over CSU objections despite not meeting the legal requirements under AB 927.

- CSU will continue to work with CCC on other issues unrelated to 4-year degrees in a collaborative fashion.
- **Comment:** 30-day review period is problematic (review period covered in legislation); can there be formal action to help faculty become aware of the issues?
- **Comment:** AB 506 asks for a means for the CCC to determine CSU curriculum (Ethnic Studies).
- **Comment:** rejection of all upcoming CCC proposals until such time as the CCC has agreed to a formal means of consultation may be warranted.
- **Comment:** separation of nuances of duplication and authorization over objections, the primary issue is that the CCC approved Feather River degree over the objections of the CSU
- **Comment:** ASCSU has weighed in on our expectations for CCC/CSU interactions
- **Comment:** to meet regional workforce needs what is the difference in cost between establishing a new degree vs. expanding existing CSU offerings (note: this assumes regionality as an element, this is not included in AB 927).

- **Response:** Student demand does not trump the California master plan and the reality that CCC/CSU duplication draws down state resources.
 - **Comment:** CSU appears to be worse at our lobbying efforts than the CCC system is.
 - **Response:** CCCs have many more regions and resources than the CSU. The CSU (unlike the CCC) does not allow the independent elements to lobby separately. There is also engagement by other groups that are interested in higher education lobbying.
 - **Comment:** At what point should the CSU investigate opportunities to offer Associate degrees? Would we be eligible for lottery funds (currently CCC-directed funding)
 - **Comment:** the Juneteenth group met last weekend. There are a number of proposals forthcoming.
 - **Response:** the CSU CO does not have a report from this group yet so cannot respond to specifics at this time (ASCSU will be consulted).
 - **Comment:** equity gap closing and recruitment / retention efforts directed to students; could we do more to recruit and retain faculty of color?
 - **Response:** system data is collected. The bulk of the work needs to happen at the campus level. (cf., promotion and tenure guidelines, cultural taxation, etc.).
- 3.2 **Cozen-O’Conner report(s).** There are discussions with the presidents at this time. There will be a published report for each campus (likely April). The Board of Trustees will receive a formal report from Cozen-O’Conner in May. It is likely, responding to the report will be costly (significant additional resources to Human Resources and Title IX campus-based efforts). It is noted that there will be new guidance forthcoming regarding Title IX from the Federal Government (“dear colleagues” letter)
- **Comment:** Thank you. ASCSU can be a partner. It would be useful to have a central repository of campus reports.
 - **Comment:** There is interest (legislation) that does a deep dive into the weeds on CSU responses to Title IX – ASCSU is likely to oppose the bill.
- 3.3 **National Council for State Authorization Reciprocity Agreements (NC-SERA):** no update
- 3.4 **Faculty Salary Study:** ASCSU will get a presentation on process, report will be presented to the Board of Trustees.

3.5 **Control of Curriculum:** there are agents (legislation, special interest groups) that undermine CSU control of the curriculum (Ethnic Studies, SB 1440, AB 928).

- **Response:** to the extent possible, we can be informative and collaborative. Each of the groups may have a different world view than we might.

4. **Trustees & Chancellor:**

4.1 Introductions:

- **Lateefah Simon:** 6th year on the board. Deep commitment to the CSU. Sees the CSU as a change agent for good.
- **Wenda Fong:** wants to ensure that the Board of Trustees gets a chance to listen to the ASCSU.
- **Interim Chancellor Koester:** noted separation of function between Board of Trustees fiduciary duty and the operational functions of the CSU CO.

4.2 **Topics:**

- future of the CSU (open fora)
- Legislative intrusion – i.e. the service-learning bill (AB 1390) would create a risk and workload issue for the CSU;
- **Question:** in addition to being good stewards of the budget and workload issues service learning exposes the CSU to risk?
- **Comment:** Reminder to the Board of Trustees that every change to the CSU has the chance to disrupt operations of department or curriculum management and assessment efforts.
- Culture of Care (with respect to ASCSU/Board of Trustees) co-governance and respect. Wrap-around support after crisis and efforts to ensure that the crisis does not emerge. There are procedure and staffing elements as well as cultural change that needs to occur.
- Cozen-O’Conner oral presentation in May: there is a lot of work ahead. The Board of Trustees is to build structure and fiscal support to move the CSU forward effectively.
- **Question:** can there be a common repository of campus reports. There will be both public and private reports (personnel issues remain private)?
- Faculty Salary Survey
- **Comment:** CSU provides a positive return on investment.

5. Jerry Schutte – [CSU Emeritus and Retired Faculty & Staff Association \(CSU-ERSA Report\)](#)

6. Al Liddicoat, Faculty Compensation Study Update
 - 6.1 This presentation is regarding the Mercer report
 - 6.2 slides will be available to the body
 - 6.3 Coverage of the implementation (vs. results) of the faculty salary survey.
7. **Charles Toombs**, California Faculty Association (CFA) President – CFA Liaison Report
 - 7.1 **Comment:** can numbers of Student Ratings of Teaching be brought into the Collective Bargaining Agreement (CBA).
 - 7.2 Faculty Salary Study
 - **Comment:** CFA might pursue tracking CSU vs CCC salaries
 - 7.3 Open bargaining (description and future)
 - articles we will be reopening on: salary, workload, paid leave, and health and safety.
 - We hope to be at table after May Budget Revise, so late May or early June.
 - CFA's Bargaining survey is open until April 7 and we need as much faculty input as we can get to help us in making our bargaining proposals.
 - Campus-based bargaining meetings
 - 7.4 Mentioned Chancellor search and that CSU unions had an opportunity to offer input; not sure our input will carry any weight.
 - 7.5 Mentioned CFA's Equity Conference held last week.
8. **Dixie Samaniego**, California State Student Association (CSSA) Vice President of Systemwide Affairs – CSSA Liaison Report
 - 8.1 The role of food services on campus (health and safety)
 - **Comment:** SB 640 is of potential concern
 - 8.2 CSSA input into the Chancellor Search
 - 8.3 Vaccination policies (removal of institutional barriers)
 - 8.4 Mental Health Services (SB 11 – ban on telehealth services – CSSA will not support legislation that risks the health of students and is concerned about the potential removal of mental health services if telehealth services are restricted). The gap in service availability of mental health services remains a deep concern.
9. **Adam Swenson**, Chair, Faculty Trustee Recommending Committee
 - 9.1 Faculty Trustee 2023-2025 Candidate Presentations, Q&A period
 - 9.2 Election of candidates for Faculty Trustee
 - 9.3 Nominees that will be forwarded to the Governor:
 - Dr. Romey Sabalius (current faculty trustee, Faculty at SJSU)

- Dr. Darlene Yee-Melichar (current ASCSU senator, Faculty at SFSU)
10. **Reflections on the Plenary** [new modality or anything else]
 - 10.1 Comments on hybrid format
 - 10.2 Concerns of equitable treatment of all senators
 - 10.3 Acknowledgement of staffing challenges and the very tight timeline of ASCSU plenary action (esp. Re: submission/updates of resolution content)
 11. **Committee of the Whole** (regarding Black Student Success)
 - 11.1 Stories of Discrimination
 - 11.2 Micro-Aggressions
 - 11.3 Faculty Retention dashboard / equity gaps ("if you do not measure it, it does not matter")
 - 11.4 Area E (lifelong learning) – content & skills seminar: related to working to increase retention (now in the 80th percentile)
 - 11.5 Historically black colleges – learning from others regarding (black) student success
 - 11.6 Changing faculty culture – the same people show up to the same style of meetings.
 - 11.7 There is a lower retention rate for faculty of color and for students of color
 - 11.8 Students of color are more likely to be influenced by travel disruptions
 - Propensity to differentially involve police when an event involves faculty or students of color

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS

(note: two first reading items from January did not return for second readings in March)

1. [AS-3587-23/APEP \(Rev\)](#) "Recommending a Fourth Year of Mathematics/Quantitative Reasoning" *Approved*
2. [AS-3590-23/AA \(Rev\)](#) "Request for Additional Input for the CSU 2030 Challenges: Faculty Perspectives Project" *Approved*
3. [AS-3591-23/FGA/AA \(Rev\)](#) "A Call for State Gas/Oil Excess Profit Fee Funding in Support of Public Higher Education" *Approved*
4. [AS-3592-23/FA \(Rev\)](#) "Compensation for AB 928 Implementation" *Approved*
5. [AS-3593-23/EX \(Rev\)](#) "Revision of Special Rule Governing Debate on Substantive Motions" *Approved*
6. [AS-3594-23/APEP \(Rev\)](#) "Regarding Coursework and Correspondences in Subject Matter Domains for Teaching" *Approved*
7. [AS-3595-23/FA/FGA \(Rev\)](#) "Equitable Capping of Executive Administrative Raises in the CSU Compared to Other Unit Employee Raises" *Approved*

8. [AS-3597-23/FA \(Rev\)](#) "Dissemination of Report and Recommendations by the Cozen O'Connor Team Investigating Title IX Practices on CSU Campuses" *Approved*
9. [AS-3598-23/EX \(Rev\)](#) "Apportionment of Academic Senate CSU (ASCSU) Seats" *Approved*
10. [AS-3599-23/APEP \(Rev\)](#) "California State University Authority Over Changes to College Preparatory A-G Standards and Guidelines" *Approved*
11. [AS-3600-23/FA \(Rev\)](#) "Support and Commendation for University of California Graduate Student and Post-Doctoral Workers" *Approved*
12. [AS-3601-23/AA \(Rev\)](#) "Support for Maintaining Veterans' Centers on All CSU Campuses" *Approved*
13. [AS-3602-23/APEP](#) "Recommendation Regarding Advanced Placement Precalculus" *Approved Unanimously*
14. [AS-3603-23/FGA/JEDI](#) "On AB 506 and Control of the CSU Curriculum" [First Reading/Waiver] [Approved]
15. [AS-3604-23/EX](#) "In Memoriam: Michael Ritter, Academic Senate CSU Senator 2015-16" *Approved*
16. [AS-3605-23/FGA](#) "2023 Legislative Advocacy Positions of the Academic Senate of the California State University (ASCSU)" *Approve*
17. [AS-3607-23/EX](#) "Commendation for ASCSU Senator Leo Van Cleve" *Approved by Acclamation*
18. [AS-3618-23/AA](#) "Condemnation of the California Community College's Decision to Proceed with a Duplicative Baccalaureate Degree" *Approved*

**THE FOLLOWING FIRST READING ITEMS WILL BE ADDRESSED AT THE MAY 2023
ASCSU PLENARY**

1. AS-3596-23/APEP (Rev) "Engaging Disciplinary Faculty in the Development of the Early Childhood Education Specialist Credential" [Referred to Committee until May 2023 ASCSU Plenary]
2. AS-3606-23/EX "ASCSU Awards for Outstanding Contributions to the CSU"
3. AS-3608-23/AA "CSU Discipline Council Involvement in California Community College (CCC) Course Review"
4. AS-3609-23/FGA "Encouraging Campus Faculty Legislative Specialists"
5. AS-3610-23/AA "Exploring the Impact of Artificial Intelligence (AI) on Higher Education Instruction"

6. AS-3611-23/EX "Academic Senate CSU 2023-2024 Meetings"
7. AS-3612-23/AA "Graduate Education as Value-Added Outcome for Public Higher Education in California"
8. AS-3613-23/AA "On the Process of Identifying and Resolving Issues of Duplication of CSU programs in AB 927 California Community College 4-year Baccalaureate Programs"
9. AS-3614-23/JEDI "Solidarity with Immunocompromised Caregivers and ASCSU Members with Disabilities"
10. AS-3615-23/AA "On the Separation of CSU GE Breadth from Cal-GETC"
11. AS-3616-23/FA "Providing Timely and Quality Counseling within the CSU"
12. AS-3617-23/JEDI "Amending the Constitution of the Academic Senate, the California State University (ASCSU) to Add Three Designated Temporary Faculty Positions"
13. AS-3619-23/FA "Maintaining Educational Continuity During Emergencies and Disasters"
14. AS-3620-23/JEDI "Change in Bylaws of the Academic Senate of the California State University (ASCSU) to Accommodate the Addition of Three Designated Temporary Faculty Positions"

ADJOURNMENT