

Academic Senate CSU (ASCSU)
401 Golden Shore, Suite 243
Long Beach, CA 90802-4210

Beth A. Steffel, Chair
Phone: 909-781-1820
E-mail: bsteffel@csusb.edu

www.calstate.edu/csu-system/faculty-staff/academic-senate

ASCSU Plenary Minutes January 19-20, 2023 Office of the Chancellor (Remote)

Thursday, January 19, 2023, 8AM-5PM

- **Thursday, January 19, 2023, 12:30PM-1:30PM** New Senator Orientation
- **Thursday, January 19, 2023, 5:15PM-6:30PM** Senate Social

Friday, January 20, 2023, 8AM-5PM

Senators: Kevin Baaske, David Barsky, Kris Bezdecny, Stephanie Burkhalter, Elizabeth Boyd, Nola Butler-Byrd, Paul Carpenter, Robert Collins, Eniko Csomay, Steven Filling, Rick Ford, Nancy Gerber, Carolyn Gibbs, Mark Groen, Tabitha Hart/Reiko Kataoka (Th/Fr substitutes for Julia Curry), Tracy Hamilton, Christine Isakson, Kelly Janousek, Michael Jenkins, Kristi Kanel, Eileen Klink, Gary Laver, Ryne Leuzinger, Mark Martinez, Janet Millar, Michael Milligan, Monty Mola, Dana Nakano, Elaine Newman, Thomas Norman, Michelle Ramos Pellicia, Steve Rein, Boris Ricks, Simon Rodan, Steve Rein, Simon Rodan, Susan Schlievert, Jerry Schutte, Richard Senghas, Jason Shepard, Beth Steffel, Praveen Soni, Elizabeth Sussman-Dabach, Adam Swenson, Laura Talamante, William Tsai, Gwen Urey, Kristen Van Gaasbeck, Mark Van Selst, Nicholas Von Glahn, Scott Waltz, Wil Weston, Greg Wood, Meiling Wu-Winiarski, Darlene Yee-Melichar.

Invited Guests / Others: Romey Sabalius (Faculty Trustee), Charles Toombs (CFA), Brent Foster (CSU CO), Jeanne Tran-Martin (CSU CO), Jeni Kitchell (CSU CO), Leslie Kennedy (CSU CO), Wendy Fong (Chair, CSU Board of Trustees), Jolene Koester (Interim Chancellor, CSU CO), Douglas Faigan (Vice Chair, Board of Trustees), Sylvia Alva (Executive Vice Chancellor, CSU CO), Dixie Samaniego (CSSA), Ed Sullivan (CSU CO), Jean Tran-Martin (CSSA), Tracy Butler (ASCSU Director), Reem Osman (ASCSU Administrative Support)

CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

[Interruption Statement](#)

ROLL CALL

1. Quorum established
2. Steffel, Baaske names needs to be fixed on roll call form

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

1. Edit to 9.3 (co-sponsorship FA/FGA 3580)
2. Edit to 8.2 (spelling of last name)

APPROVAL OF THE NOVEMBER 3-4, 2023, MINUTES

Edit to text in Reports and link to legislative specialist report for November, 2022

ANNOUNCEMENTS

None

PRESENTATIONS/INTRODUCTIONS

None

REPORTS

Academic Senate CSU Chair's Report

Response to question re: Chancellor's Search Structures

Standing committees

1. Fiscal and Governmental Affairs (FGA) [Rein]
 - 1.1. No questions (AS-3591 updated by email)
2. Faculty Affairs (FA) [Bezdecny]
 - 2.1. No questions, an update to the report will be available (fixing the name of one of the resolutions)
3. Academic Affairs (AA) [Rodan]
 - 3.1. Concern regarding California Community College (CCC) movement re: AB 927 and CCC baccalaureate degrees.
4. Justice, Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion (JEDI) [Butler-Byrd]
 - 4.1. Thank you to chair for introductory statement on appropriateness of interruption
 - 4.2. Question re: loss of Faculty of Color to other institutions
5. Academic Preparation and Educational Programs (APEP) [Hamilton]
 - 5.1. Dr. Baaske (substitute for Riggio) joined APEP for spring 2023
 - 5.2. Some resolutions carried over from November due to work on AB 928 (Transfer Model Curriculum [TMC] & General Education [GE] revisions)
6. Legislative Specialists [Isakson/Schutte]
 - 6.1. New software (Abstract) effective in assessment and monitoring of bills.
 - 6.2. Reception for new California state senators, democratic super-majority in both houses

- 6.3. Two new heads of the Senate and Assembly Education Committees
- 6.4. California budget remains 5% increase (less fixed costs) - CSU is less than half of ask re: needs for CSU.
- 6.5. Advocacy training conference at Cal Poly Pomona for every CSU campus. We might think about how to mobilize each individual campus to support ASCSU agenda.
- 6.6. Legislative specialist notes that legislature does not recognize how poorly [AB 927](#) was written but that AA/legislative specialists are following up on an attempt to "fix" the legislation (legislative 'solutions' sometimes require legislative corrections)
- 6.7. A question was raised regarding the strengths and weaknesses of a campus-based approach to legislative advocacy.
- 6.8. A question was raised regarding the possible legislative solution (Muratsuchi) to the relatively low approval rate for Ethnic Studies (ES) course (CSU GE Area 7) despite the fact that the lower approval rate is due to the courses not meeting evaluation criteria.
- 6.9. Senate and Assembly budget committees retain their Chairs year-to-year, both have been friendly to the CSU.
7. [General Education Advisory Committee \(GEAC\) \[Csomay\]](#)
 - 7.1. Cambridge international is trying to fill the same space as Advanced Placement (AP) and International Baccalaureate (IB) high school coursework. Individually Cambridge is being used for credit at some CSUs, there is not a system rule (yet).
 - 7.2. The normative status of American Institutions is a two course (six-unit) sequence. The discussion of a single course (e.g., San Luis Obispo four-unit courses, also at 1 or more CCCs) seems contrary to adequate preparation being present (especially for teaching preparation/competency). Note that GEAC is NOT recommending any changes to American Institutions implementation within the CSU at this time.
8. [CSU Faculty Trustee \[Sabalius\]](#)
 - 8.1. Two-part written report; November Board of Trustees (BOT) report and a more recent update.
 - 8.2. Planned realignment of budget to mirror trends in enrollment for the future. There are pros and cons such alignment.
 - 8.3. Governor's Budget maintained compact funding but compact required +1% enrollment whereas we are actually near -7% enrollment in the CSU.
 - 8.4. **Comment:** A possible slight-of-hand with CSU being asked to float a bond and have the state repay the \$27 Million bond maintenance fee (but

no obligation for continuing support and/or that it would show as "support" for the CSU but actually just continued funding of the \$400 Million for Academic Year 2022-23).

- 8.5. Questions about the history and current status of the BOT/CSU CO relations
- 8.6. Retaining a president for an additional 6 months is possible (with limit of no more than 50% of prior pay and service is "at will"). Administrators now forfeit retreat rights "for cause".
- 8.7. Faculty Trustee Recommending Committee [Swenson]
- 8.8. The potential nominees will be considered by the committee next week and those that meet the qualifications per the committee will be forwarded to the senate for future consideration as potential faculty trustee nominees.
- 8.9. Other Reports

SPEAKERS

1. Sylvia Alva, Executive Vice Chancellor of Academic and Student Affairs
 - 1.1. Rose Bowl Parade float (Cal poly Pomona, Cal poly Sa Luis Obispo) was award-winning, kudos.
 - 1.2. [AB 928](#), comment: Intersegmental General Education Transfer Curriculum (IGETC) for Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics (STEM) seems to be removed by the requirement that what is now Cal-GETC be a singular GE package (and not one with multiple versions)
 - 1.3. American Institutions: charge to CSU GEAC was to examine American Institutions; GEAC suggests AI implementation in the CSU is ok. **Question:** Are there CSU CO directives that would change/modify the CSU American Institutions requirement? **Answer:** the move to look at AI is motivated by unit limits within some STEM disciplines (this suggests a local rather than global fix should be considered).
 - 1.4. Two GE patterns is an option (transfer, local) -- what to do with "swirl" and which package which students should be held to. What are the unintended consequences (unit limit shopping)? **Comment:** there are pros and cons to having CSU GE as well as Cal-GETC as separate processes.
 - 1.5. The [AB 928](#) implementation committee is asked to focus on a number of different questions/topics outside of the transfer GE package (which is not part of their purview).
 - 1.6. Fall 2023: we will be launching dual admissions (CCC/CSU)
 - 1.7. Academic and Student Affairs-related topics: (1) [AB 927](#), CCC 4-year degrees, (2) [AB 928](#), singular lower division GE transfer pattern (Cal-GETC), (3) spot bill (placeholder) re: expanding CSU authorization to offer applied

doctorates, (4) CalNAGPRA (Native American Graves, Protection, and Repatriation Act) higher education, etc. -- must offer to repatriate and return cultural artifacts.

- 1.8. [AB 927](#): CCC four-year degrees (follow up to SB 850 4-year pilot programs). Overview and update on next steps. How the CSU CO should partner with the ASCSU. How to best engage disciplinary faculty experts with the CCC degree proposals. [AS-3526-22/AA \(Rev\)](#) suggested CSU processes to respond to requests; [AS-3567-22/FGA \(Rev\)](#) suggests legislative fix to the legislative problems in [AB 927](#).

- 1.9. Chancellor's search process – logic and structures

2. Charles Toombs – California Faculty Association (CFA) Liaison Report

- 2.1. Preparing for bargaining re-openers; CSU will re-open on benefits.
- 2.2. Bargaining committee met last week to establish plans for the spring term.
- 2.3. Expect to be at the bargaining table in May.
- 2.4. Currently reaching out to faculty (bargaining survey, after Feb 4th) -- a series of statewide meetings will be upcoming.
- 2.5. Salaries have not kept up with cost of living; workload issues are also of increased attention.
- 2.6. There is not enough money in the Governor's budget (and revise) for adequate compensation changes.
- 2.7. Intention is for transparency and alignment with broad faculty needs.
- 2.8. Anti-racism, anti-black racism action requests to the Board of Trustees have not been responded to. CFA has reached out to legislators regarding systemic bias /systemic racism.
- 2.9. Equity conference planned for March (diversity, equity, inclusion)
- 2.10. American Association of University Professors (AAUP) red-book possible changes to statements re: "anti-woke" response (e.g., to critical race theory, anti-discrimination, Florida banning AP in African American Studies [AFAM] studies, etc.)
- 2.11. CFA interested in teacher education preparation for Ethnic Studies preparation.
- 2.12. Contracting out unit-3 work (timely MD re: counselling through an application vs. more traditional mental health maintenance actions).
- 2.13. **Comment:** no current CFA curriculum actions anticipated
- 2.14. **Comment:** request for regional COLA for new salary dollars
- 2.15. **Comment:** request for correspondence with APEP re: teacher preparation (ethnic studies) -- referred to ethnic studies council.

3. Jolene Koester, Interim CSU Chancellor

- 3.1. Resetting budgets to align with enrollment by campus (AY 24-25 anticipated start of movement of funds with a disconnect of target/funds of >10%).
- 3.2. CSU is now (AY 22-23) down 7% overall under-enrollment relative to target.
- 3.3. Comment: Pressure from low CCC enrollments (and thus low transfers), increased pressure of UC to admit transfer students, AB927 ccc 4-year degrees, high school graduation reductions.
- 3.4. Seven CSUs have long-term under-enrollment trends in targets vs. received funds. (CSU Channel Islands has a shorter history but greater disconnect between target and enrollment).
- 3.5. Comment: regarding the compact with the governor, is there likely a revision to the governor and/or legislature? answer: we do not know – the governor’s revision holds to existing commitment to the CSU. The [compact](#) has a number of highlights – increasing access, increasing equity, increasing affordability, increased intersegmental coordination, increase online offerings. These reports are all available on the CSU CO website (academic affairs). Much of the reporting this year consists of descriptions of what data will be tracked (what metrics will be reported). The primary metrics are student enrollment and student graduation. We need to demonstrate effort to address these metrics.
- 3.6. [AB 927](#): CCC 4-year degrees. Collegial conversation around how to find agreements where we can, ideally producing collaborative ideas to allow us to move forward.
- 3.7. [AB 927](#) and [AB 928](#) are both legislative meddling. Is it time to reconstruct a ‘new’ master plan?
- 3.8. Six upcoming presidential searches: LA, Chico, Sac, Sonoma, Maritime, Stanislaus (Chronological order)

4. Trustee Chair Wenda Fong, Trustee Douglas Faigin, and Jolene Koester, Interim CSU Chancellor

- 4.1. Chancellor’s strategic workgroup to look at enrollment

5. Dixie Samaniego (CSSA Vice President) California State Student Association (CSSA) Liaison Report

- 5.1. There are many CSSA search committee involvements with the CSU CO ongoing.
- 5.2. There are a number of legislative bills of potential interest.
- 5.3. January 30th deadline for student trustee applicants.
- 5.4. CSSA “campus challenges” now include ‘points’ for student organizations to reach out to their campus senates to ensure that student needs are brought forward.

- 5.5. Campus dining discussions – why is it in front of CSSA? What is the take home message for ASCSU senators to bring back to their campuses? A: the concerns about best practices in establishing appropriate dining services for their student bodies. Some of the big 4-5 players (CISCO, ARAMARK, etc.) seem to produce a disconnect between claims of quality/affordability and the lived experience as reported by students. The delivery of contracted services may not be fully realized by the vendor.
- 5.6. CSSA policy agenda: Goal to have students seen as equal stakeholders within the CSU community – are students included in the conversation (e.g., Title IX scan/assessment)?
- 5.7. Course Costs / textbook affordability issues
6. Jerry Schutte – [CSU-ERFSA Report](#)
 - 6.1. With COVID concerns ERFSA remains meeting remotely.
 - 6.2. Remaining concerns re: health plan issues (Calpers revoking settlement)
 - 6.3. Remaining concerns re: employment constraints under COVID and inequity in support for FERP faculty in transition to online under COVID.
 - 6.4. ERFSA reporter (comes out approximately every 2nd month). comment: advocacy for continued distribution given content such as that from Stohs and Pasternack (investing prior and during retirement). Shapiro has work on climate change (youtube).
7. Gina Maisto Smith - Chair; Leslie Gomez - Vice Chair, Institutional Response Group, Cozen O'Conner
 - 7.1. Community engagement is important and Cozen O'Conner wants to be able to see the effects on the campuses deriving from the campus visits.
 - 7.2. Cozen O'Conner reports are somewhat "live" in that the written reports may be modified with the introduction of new information (note surveys remain open past the original drafting of the report)
 - 7.3. Overview of campus visits, aggregate themes, opportunities for improvement, recommendations
 - 7.4. Survey remains open to Feb 15th but reports to presidents will start earlier in February (approximately 2200 responses across the system at the present time). Additional outreach
 - 7.5. Potential recommendations might include: coordination of prevention processes, creation of bias incident reporting, strengthening employee relations responses, strengthen confidential resources, formalizing meeting structures and information flow, mapping processes for efficiency and avoiding conflict, separation of assessment/advocacy, systemic interventions (referral to BoT).
 - 7.6. The PowerPoint will be shared with the listserv.

7.7. Cozen O'Conner has met with senates for follow up visits (cf., Dominguez Hills) and will return to a number of others in the future (Sonoma, San Jose State, Stanislaus, ...)

1. Discussion of Meeting Modality

- *No requirement for others to be in person, but prohibition to those who do want to meet*
- *Context of trends nationally/internationally re: COVID*
- *Long Beach requirements*
- *Other meetings continue to meet in person for the last x years*
- *Survey appears biased to non-attendance*
- *Survey timing (cut-off for responses), survey sharing*
- *Communication re: intention (4-week, 2-week communication)*
- *Text option for updates*
- *Split in senate across those wanting to remain remote vs. Those wanting to meet in person.*
- *Paternal vs. Individual decisions. Allow individuals to make their own choices. – counterpoint is that public health is a public concern.*
- *CSU CO accommodations (HEPPA filter, etc.)*
- *Possible long-term budgetary impact of non-use of travel funds (AY 2020/21 – present)*
- *Marginalization of influence of ASCSU with continued remote meeting.*
- *Violation of implicit promise re: January in-person*
- *Lack of effectiveness of ASCSU when not paired with in-person context/interaction*
- *What is harm of allowing people to choose their own path (in person vs. Online)*
- *Concerns re: double-booking with any online meeting (senators tend to make modifications to classes when in person but just leave meeting when remote...)*
- *Masking/testing accommodations may be a possible measure to ameliorate risk*
- *Travel costs to a typical ASCSU meeting (in person 3-day plus GEAC) are 45000-55000*
- *Severely conflicted by the conversation – COVID remains, ASCSU needs to be effective. CSU CO reallocation of general fund monies may detract from ASCSU budget (esp. Re: travel).*
- *Hybrid format for DUMKE worked for international programs meeting.*
- *Can an individual committee meet "in person" even if the plenary does not nominally permit that option?*

- *Hybrid meetings are harder to run than full in-person or full online (everyone needs to be on zoom if zoom used for the meeting – speaker list, etc.; this requires sufficient bandwidth, etc.)*
- *We should NOT have our first true hybrid in May given the heavy agenda typically encountered in the last meeting of the year.*
- *Equity in network opportunities vs. What is the best for ASCSU effectiveness (equity concerns in hyflex environments re: socialization, etc.)*
- *Public health re: community and those you interact with so an argument can be made that the individual choice potentially has impacts beyond the individual.*
- *What is the default status re: authorization to travel, etc.*
- *The plenary body can require masks independent of LA County requirements.*
- *Zoom happy-hours do not sufficiently build community – the return on investment (time/attention) to ASCSU may not encourage committed participation/engagement of elected representatives; alternatively, there are connections that have been built via these events with respect to senator-to-senator interactions. Some senators have indicated this absence is a concern re: re-upping for an additional senate term.*
- *Time and attention to allow this discussion is appreciated.*
- *From the Chair: prior to the decision to cancel in-person option, there was a trend away from an in-person preference.*
- *From the Chair: Senate extended executive is more-than-most likely to remain not in-person and deep concerns about how to make a hybrid meeting work effectively.*

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS

[AS-3578-22/JEDI \(Rev\)](#) "Expansion of California State University (CSU) Independent Doctoral Degree Programs" [Approved]

[AS-3579-22/FGA \(Rev\)](#) "Funding Summer Advocacy Work for the Position of Legislative Specialist of the Academic Senate CSU (ASCSU)" [Approved]

[AS-3580-22/FA \(Rev\)](#) "Request for Increased Ventilation and Air Filtration Infrastructure Across the California State University (CSU) System" [Approved]

[AS-3581-22/JEDI/FA \(Rev\)](#) "Adopting a Font Designed for Readability for California State University (CSU) Business" [Approved]

[AS-3582-22/FA \(Rev\)](#) "Solidarity with Iranian University Communities Protesting Violent Repression in Response to the 'Woman, Life, Freedom' Movement" [Approved]

[AS-3583-22/EX \(Rev\)](#) "In Support of Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act (NAGRPA) Compliance in the California State University (CSU)" [Approved Unanimously]

[AS-3584-22/FA \(Rev\)](#) "Establishing Timely Responses to Campus Senate Resolutions and Policies" [Approved]

[AS-3585-22/JEDI/FA/FGA \(Rev\)](#) "CSU Faculty and Staff Justice Equity and Diversity (JEDI) Housing Assistance Program" [Approved]

[AS-3586-22/JEDI/FA \(Rev\)](#) "Systemic Inclusion of Preferred Names and Pronouns within the California State University (CSU) System" [Approved]

Withdrawn

The following resolutions was withdrawn.

AS-3588-23/FA (Rev) "Urging Meaningful Campus Visits by Cozen O'Connor to the CSU Fresno, San José, and Sonoma State University Campuses" [Withdrawn]

First Reading

The following resolutions were presented for feedback from Senators and communication to campuses. The sponsoring committee(s) will revise these resolutions and introduce them for action at the May 2023 plenary.

AS-3587-23/APEP (Rev) "Supporting a Fourth Year of Mathematics/Quantitative Reasoning"

AS-3589-23/APEP "Academic Senate Meeting Modality"

AS-3590-23/AA "Request for Additional Input for the CSU 2030 Challenges: Faculty Perspectives Project"

AS-3591-23/FGA/AA "A Call for State Gas/Oil Excess Profit Fee Funding in Support of Public Higher Education"

AS-3592-23/FA "Compensation for AB 928 Curricular Reform"

AS-3593-23/EX "Revision of Special Rule Governing Debate on Substantive Motions"

AS-3594-23/APEP "Regarding Coursework and Correspondences in Subject Matter Domains for Teaching"

AS-3595-23/FA/FGA "Equitable Capping of Executive Administrative Raises in the CSU Compared to Other Unit Employee Raises"

AS-3596-23/APEP "Engaging Disciplinary Faculty in the Development of the Early Childhood Education Specialist Credential"

AS-3597-23/FA "Dissemination of Report and Recommendations by the Cozen O'Connor team investigating Title IX practices on CSU campuses"

AS-3598-23/EX "Apportionment of Academic Senate CSU (ASCSU) Seats"

AS-3599-23/APEP "California State University Authority Over Changes to College Preparatory A-G Standards and Guidelines"

AS-3600-23/FA "Support and Commendation for Graduate Student and Post-Doctoral Workers"

AS-3601-23/AA "Support for Maintaining Veterans' Centers on all CSU Campuses

AS-3602 -23/APEP "Recommendation Regarding Advanced Placement Precalculus"

ADJOURNMENT