ASCSU Plenary Minutes
January 20-21, 2022
CSU Office of the Chancellor Zoom

Thursday, January 20, 2022 – 8:30 to 5:00 p.m.
ASCSU New Senator Orientation 12:00 to 1:00 p.m.
Senate Social - 5:00 p.m. to 7:00 p.m.

Friday, January 21, 2022 – 8:00 a.m. to 3:00 p.m.

(Bakersfield) Martinez; (Channel Islands) Grzegorczyk, Pereira; (Chico) Boyd, Ford;
(Dominguez Hills) Norman, Talamante; (East Bay) Glass, Wu; (Fresno) Jenkins,
Schlievert; (Fullerton) Matz, Milligan, Stambough; (Humboldt) Burkhalter, Pachmayer;
(Long Beach) Janousek, Klink, Soni; (Los Angeles) Bezdecny, Riggio; (Maritime)
Isakson, Tsai; (Monterey Bay) Leuzinger, Lopez-Littleton; (Northridge) Ricks,
Swenson; (Pomona) Speak, Urey; (Sacramento) Hamilton, Holl, Van Gaasbeck; (San
Bernardino) Groen, Steffel; (San Diego) Butler-Byrd, Csomay, Ornatowski; (San
Francisco) Collins, Gerber, Yee-Melichar; (San José) Curry, Rodan, Van Selst; (San
Luis Obispo) Laver, Rein; (San Marcos) Barsky, Pellicia; (Sonoma) Ostroff, Senghas;
(Stanislaus) Filling, Nakano; (ERFSA) Schutte

CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME
With a quorum being present, the meeting was called to order at 9:00 a.m. and Chair
Collins welcomed the body.

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA
Agenda was approved.

APPROVAL OF THE NOVEMBER 4-5, 2021 MINUTES
Minutes were approved

PRESENTATIONS/INTRODUCTIONS
Senator Celly of CSU Dominguez Hills was welcomed as a substitute for her campus
during the Friday morning portion of plenary.
ANNOUNCEMENTS

None

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE: CAMPUS CONCERNS ABOUT COVID-19

There was a robust conversation about faculty and student concerns about how campuses are handling Spring semester repopulation. Several anecdotes were very moving and provide strong evidence faculty should be collaborating more closely with campus and system leaders. Assistant Vice Chancellor Van Cleve was encouraged to share his notes from this discussion with the Chancellor’s Office.

REPORTS

Chair – Robert Keith Collins

Good morning. Happy New Year, and Happy belated Martin Luther King Day. I wish that the day was a day where I could say that voting rights in this country were solid, and we were on solid ground with them. I can't. But one thing that gives me hope are all the faces that I'm looking at right now. Every one of you are committed and dedicated to the process that actually enabled voting rights, but also most importantly people to express their voice their aims and their values, even when we disagree. And we should disagree often, because we're all different people with different perspective, different cultures, different attitudes, and different desires out of life, but we all represent something-- the common good. I know that word and that notion is not part of the common vocabulary, but the ASCSU embodies this. So, with that, today, of all days, when I know that my voting rights are in jeopardy, you all make me proud to continue a fight that my mother engaged in and my father, grandparents, great grandparents, and great-great grandparents fought for friendship, language and culture in New Orleans’ schools. They still fought for their values and goals in mind. So, for the CSU, let us do that. Today, let us encourage all within this system to express their voice, their culture, their attitudes, their desires and goals in mind and bring this together so that the one word “CSU” represents all of those desires, aims and values.

Human progress is neither automatic nor inevitable. Even a superficial look at history reveals that no social advance rolls in with inevitability toward the goal of justice. It requires sacrifice, suffering and struggle, the tireless exertions and passionate concern of dedicated individuals. Without persistent effort, time itself becomes an ally of the insurgent and primitive forces of irrational emotionalism and social destruction. This is no time for apathy or complaints. This is a time for vigorous, positive action. In quote, when the Reverend Dr. Martin Luther King made the aforementioned statement, his goal was to remind us all that positive action and dedicated individuals like ourselves, are the engines of social advancement. In the nation's largest, most diverse and let me add most genuinely student-centered institution for higher education, this role is the responsibility of us all. All the passionate concerns of dedicated individuals enabled belonging and common unity necessary for social advance. The challenge before us all is to ensure that apathy and complacency do not keep us from the tireless exertion and curriculum in
curriculum delivery, shared governance, and the Scholarship of Teaching and Learning necessary to reduce barriers to our own successes, and those of our students.

In the spirit of tireless exertions and success that I commend our union, the California Faculty Association, and the CSU administration for having reached a tentative agreement on our contract. In the words of Secretary Deb Holland, Laguna Pueblo citizens, and the first Native American Secretary of the Department of Interior both seemingly were able to put forward quote, the very best we have to offer in quote during bargaining. It has been the spirit of enabling belonging through positive actions that are present my efforts on behalf of the ASCSU since November 2021. Two practices that have shaped my approach to furthering further promoting common unity and enabling belonging are effective communication and advocating for how faculty should enable students. These efforts include or were not limited to the following, and one that we should all be aware of. I've had two very good conversations with President of WSCUC who was unable to make this meeting. However, she is looking to join us at our March meeting.

So please, bring question, bring perspectives about online education and how we can serve as a resource to her in her decision making when she's with us. The second is that I have met remotely repeatedly. I have also been in conversation with the other system chairs in ICAS about AB 928 and there are three things that faculty should know. The first conversations have just begun to AB 928 and it requires a singular pathway. This singular pathway is only 34 units which represents 11 classes. To date, there is only one class that has been dropped into that 11 class bucket and that is ethnic studies. All three ICAS chairs are in agreement that ethnic studies will be part of this new pathway.

The others are part of common discussion which you can use to report out however, and I encourage you all to stay current and report out to campuses, so our colleagues are clear. Another thing everyone should know is that we are very attentive to oral communication, as well as critical thinking. These are two areas that are doubly linked to the great successes that the CSU faculty have had with their students, and they are in alliance with the California Community College.

I want to remind everyone that our Portal to collect feedback portal is live. There have been some concerns about some of the questions on the format, Director Butler and I we will be working together to make changes so that the survey reads more clearly. But most importantly, please encourage all your campus colleagues and constituents to put forward their voice. I really want to strongly encourage that no voice goes unrecognized in this process.

I spent my break with good food, lots of chocolate and bourbon, reviewing the bylaws and constitution to assess for gender sensitive language, and little to no gender sensitive language was found. The question is whether to use the word they as some campuses are doing and he will ask the Dean of the Council of Ethnic Studies if she will come and give us a brief presentation on the use of they and then most importantly, why it's important
for all of us to enable all of the usages, so that we can maintain the common unity that we represent.

Next to ensure effective communication and our advocacy at the Capitol are in full swing. With help from the Chancellor’s team a group of senators were able to participate in a tour of the Capitol and explanation of how to interact more, not just with the Chancellor’s Office representatives in Sacramento, but also with legislators and their staffers and people most important. What this opportunity did was allow for us also to get to meet senior advisors and the CSU team has volunteered to open up this opportunity to the ASCSU.

What I would like to do is, as mentioned before, is revitalize the old practice where because of Zoom technology, we all can be part of the group that used to go up when I first came on to the ASCSU, so that the legislators and their staffers can utilize our diversity and meet us not just in our phenotypical diversity but also our disciplinary diversity. And this would be paired with students, which was the normal practice, a senator and a student meeting with legislators and staffers. And I've also asked the Alumni Association to consider that collective effort. So we would have meetings with three people- the faculty, the students, and the example of students success in our alumni who could meet with legislators and staffers to convey a strong message about what the CSU does, especially the faculty, not just for the students of the state of California, but also how many examples of student success we have.

May is a special month where everything gets rushed and crushed. I want you all to start early. We have senators that will be rotating off so it's delegations from your campus. Please get started on the commendations for the senators that you know, will be rotating off during the April interim. We will gather these names in preparation for this commendation to be read during the May plenary. Next is the issue ethnic studies implementation. AA chair Rodan continues to reach out to the Council on Ethnic Studies and I have received word from ethnic studies faculty, that implementation is going well. Where there are problems, they are disciplinary biases being presented. I urge all of us to remind our campus colleagues and constituents that ethnic studies are fields, they are not just areas or programs. They are over 50 years old and as an anthropologist and a person who teaches in ethnic studies, my field once upon a time was the baby brother, so to speak. Ethnic studies is that baby brother and it is nearly half the age of anthropology, which is over 100 years old.

First year senators, congratulations. I hope you enjoyed your first official meeting on your committee, and I hope that you enjoy your committee folk. They are great people so hopefully if we meet in person you will go to dinner to meet them. This brings me to the possible need to stay virtual for our next plenary. I will keep you posted on the recommendations from the Chancellor’s Office.
Standing committees

**Academic Affairs (AA)** – Simon Rodan, Chair
- The committee is bringing forward two second reading resolutions and two first reading resolutions for the body’s consideration.

**Academic Preparation and Education Programs (APEP)** – Rick Ford, Chair
- The committee discussed AB 928 Implementation.
- The committee also discussed admissions criteria shared a draft proposal that the SAT and ACT be dropped from admissions criteria permanently. Primary consideration for admission will be Grade Point Average (GPA) and additional coursework and characteristics of the school and external activities.
- The committee welcomed Liaison Interim Associate Vice Chancellor Jeff Gold, Education Quality Center Director, Paul Tuss and Interim Assistant Vice Chancellor Zee Cline.
- The committee also discussed ongoing- Graduation Initiative (GI) 2025, expanding access to Teacher Preparation programs, and needed Revisions to Executive Order (EO) 1077 which must be revised due to AB 130.

**Faculty Affairs (FA)** – Irene Matz, Chair
- The committee had productive meetings with Executive Vice Chancellor Alva and CFA President Toombs.
- The committee has five second reading resolutions and one first reading resolutions for the body’s consideration this plenary.

**Fiscal & Governmental Affairs (FGA)** – Elizabeth Boyd, Chair
- This is the fun and games committee. New senators Talamante and Pachmayer were welcomed to the committee.
- Work began on the legislative recommendation resolutions. Guests: Steven Filling from CFA, CSSA leaders Morales Mary Washington and discussed financial aid, housing and food insecurity. Chris Ferguson from the Department of Finance (DOF), program manager for all education related funding.
- The committee is bringing forward two second readings one co-sponsored with Faculty Affairs and a first reading resolution for the body’s consideration.

**CSU Faculty Trustee** – Romey Sabalius
- Last November the Board of Trustees met in person, but the January meeting will be virtual. The CSU will divest from fossil fuels.
- The budget was a major topic of discussion. We only asked for compensation as one-third in the budget he suggested we double our ask from $223 Million to $446 Million and lost by one vote in committee. The best we can do is look forward to future years. A faculty salary study is to be commissioned. The committee is comprised of many faculty and Faculty Trustee Sabalius believes they will seek information to disaggregate the data by gender, race and ethnicity if it is available.
• Requested a change in the order of the reports so the Board could use the information to inform their votes. They will now come right after public comment.
• The decision on Humboldt State University will be made next week.
• Questions were asked by Senators Steffel, Grzegorzyk, Soni, Talamante, and Rodan.

Other committees and committee liaisons:

**General Education Advisory Committee (GEAC)** – Mark Van Selst, Chair
- Discussions about California Community College (CCC) issues included their 4-year degree program, common course numbering, ethnic studies, oral communication, and credit for prior learning.
- A key question is when is a student matriculated? A high school student who attends community college and summer session, has catalog rights for that fall.
- Some students are graduating high school with associate degree for transfer.
- The 34 units will require a 0 to 1-unit lab and the rest will be 3-unit courses.
- How do we make GE meaningful for first year students? Could we use lower cost materials for these high enrollment classes?
- Questions were asked by Senators Yee-Melichar, and Klink.

**Ad Hoc Committee to Advance Equity Diversity and Inclusion (AEDI) in the ASCSU** – Boris Ricks, Co-Chair
- The committee discussed making changes to the Bylaws to make AEDI a permanent committee.
- They will bring resolution forward to next plenary meeting.
- They have created a calendar of activities for the committee to accomplish.
- The committee recommends additional training on diversity, equity and inclusion.
- They seek support and collaboration from other committees.

**ASCSU Legislative Specialist** – Jerald Schutte
- Legislative law is very vague, and the administrative unit has to fill in the blanks. We can see the mess of AB 427 and AB 428. January 3rd to February 18th bills must be posted, reviewed, assigned, printed and Rules Committee sends it to substantive committee. That committee has until March 15th to prepare it for the Appropriations committee by August 31st or the bill is dead. Unless the bill is held under submission which makes it a two-year bill. It could be registered as a two-year bill or a third way. A bill might have passed in a prior session, like student house AB 1377, signed by governor and chaptered becoming law. This only created a report showing the need for student housing. On January 3rd AB 1602 puts some teeth into that bill and allocates $5 billion to fund this bill and it now includes faculty, staff and students. So, there can be refinements to existing bills.
- There are some bills regarding infrastructure and broadband that might come back that are of interest to the CSU. Early this week there were 400 bills posted of
which 12 bills were of interest to the CSU today there are now 500 bills posted with 15 of interest to the CSU.

- When the CO does not take a position, they may be trying to amend the bill.
- Questions were asked by Senators Speak, Bezdecny, Laver and Van Selst.

Chief Information Officer (CIO) Council – Simon Rodan

- The transition to a single Learning Management System (LMS) is proceeding well. He is interested if iPads are the best device in supporting the CSU Success effort.

SPEAKERS

Joseph I. Castro – CSU Chancellor

The Chancellor wished us a good 2022. He is excited about Humboldt State University becoming a Polytechnic. A good conversation with the governor has led to the CSU getting more than $400 million for this conversion.

The proposal will increase the base budget by 5% and enrollment growth leading to a 7% increase overall. This gives us more security than in past years. The plan is for a 5-year commitment to 5% increases. We also want to pursue more one-time money for projects.

The CSU and CFA went from the 50-yard line to the end zone in December. Glad we found common ground. Hopefully the Board and CFA membership will approve the agreement.

The CSU is finalizing the search for a president of CSU Channel Islands and should have a decision on Wednesday.

Speak - Commented on appreciation that the value of a polytechnic model was recognized and hope the other polytechnics will get additional base funding.

Schutte - Department of Finance allocates in bulk, CSU asks in line items. The $211 million gained barely covers the anticipated increase in faculty compensation. How will you and should we couch the idea of line items versus the bulk allocation from the governor, so the tentative agreement is not lost in the shuffle.

Betsy-Boyd - The Fiscal & Governmental Affairs (FGA) committee stands ready to advocate for full funding of the CSU budget. A second point is about mode of instruction during the pandemic and impact on faculty purview on the curriculum and impact on accreditation. Request his support for our concerns.

Soni - Noted that the amount proposed by the governor is less than the request from the Board of Trustees. There have been statements the CSU is pleased or happy with the amount proposed, does this affect our future advocacy? What is your plan of action if we don’t get additional money in terms of priority, in particular in terms of the collective bargaining agreement (CBA)?

Ford - Thanked the Chancellor for taking the role to champion the CSU. His question is about mode of instruction. What is the responsibility of a president to
articulate the criteria and logic and explain their decision when they conflict with the will of the faculty?

**Holl** - As a member of the Admissions Advisory council, do you have strategies to ensure the legislature ensures the role of grades and class ranks differ from decades ago? They may not understand why we need to change criteria so we can make our opportunities available to the diverse student population wishing to join the CSU.

**Klink** - Those in the liberal arts have concerns about the changing admissions requirements and we need to ensure that we have the right requirements.

**Tsai** - Had a question about the three-year presidential review process. The campus only received a one-letter response. Is there any way to increase the transparency and communicate more details of the review?

**Yee-Melichar** - The Board approved the operating budget and with it came the request to increase faculty compensation. With the studies in place hopefully, there can be an increase in salary. What is the timeline for those results? How will this move forward?

The faculty group has assembled and is creating the timeline for their work.

**Talamante** - Echoed earlier remarks on presidential review and the campus was pleased with some of the improvements. Hasn’t heard if analysis will be disaggregated by gender, race and ethnicity which are important to ensure equity. Faculty typically rely on data from the Sacramento Bee versus more accurate information.

He will work on publishing the goal for the president and include them in reporting out.

**Jeni Kitchell, Executive Director – System Budget Report**

Overall, the Chancellor’s Office is pleased with the proposed budget. The current proposals by the CSU include a five-year compact.

The state budget is headed in a positive direction and there is currently about a $45 billion surplus and much needs to go to K-14 spending due to Proposition 98. Most of the governor’s proposals for the surplus were for one-time spending.

State tax revenues are up for the long-term which project increased revenue for the next four years. There is a $2.6 billion surplus from the current and past year, plus a projected surplus for the pending budget. The governor is interested in efforts related to climate change and infrastructure. The CSU is projected to get 2.5% growth in funding with focused money on foster youth programs.

We are happy that the CSU is slotted for $100 million in addition to $83 million for an Energy Innovation Center and $50 million in funding for the four campuses with farms.
We are requesting $673 million to fund enrollment. We asked for $1 billion and received $100 million in deferred maintenance. Student housing grant program was funded for all three segments along with a learning aligned employment program and middle-class scholarship program. The five-year compact would give the CSU a 5% increase from the general fund which is 2.85% of the operating budget. The governor would like to see enrollment grow by 1% with the 5% allocation with multiple goals around closing the equity gap and getting technology in student hands.

Questions were asked by senators Van Selst, Soni, Schutte, Ford, Yee-Melichar, Millar

Charles Toombs, CFA President – CFA Liaison Report
- Longer term contracts for contingent faculty and possible professor of practice in Memorandums of Understanding (MOUs).
- All forms of parental support in a report.
- Questions were asked by Senators Riggio, Csomay, Butler-Byrd, Nakano, Lopez Littleton, Millar, Soni, Betsey-Boyd, and Grzegorczyk.

Jerald Schutte, CSU Emeritus and Retired Faculty & Staff Association (CSU-ERSA)
Senator Schutte recapped issues concerning a recent lawsuit regarding retiree healthcare, announced that some research awards were granted in December and there is an open position at CSU-ERFSA.

Fabiola Moreno Ruelas – CSSA Liaison Report
- CSSA has felt confusion about lack of system response and less shared governance.
- There was a healthy conversation about meeting student needs as we use online technology in managing the issues created by the pandemic.

CSU Trustee Diego Arambula
- The trustee was unavailable due to illness.

**COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS**

Academic Freedom and Faculty Oversight of Curricula and Pedagogy During Times of Emergencies  
Approved

Apportionment of Academic Senate CSU (ASCSU) Seats  
Approved Unanimously

Role of Shared Governance in Decisions on Instructional Modality  
Approved

Updated Legislative Advocacy Guidelines for the Academic Senate of the California State University (ASCSU)  
Approved Unanimously

Faculty Rights to Due Process in Letters of Reprimand Within the CSU  
Approved Unanimously

Unanimously Approved
Establishing Core Competencies for CSU General Education (GE) Areas A1, A2, A3, and B4, Studying Online Education and the Impact of Campus Initiatives

Faculty Rights to Due Process in Disciplinary Action Procedures Within the CSU
Increasing the Membership of the Ad Hoc Committee to Advance Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion (AEDI) Within the ASCSU
Support of Faculty Supervision of Student Research, Scholarly, and Creative Activities in the CSU Approved
Recognition and Support of Faculty Participation in Shared Governance

Call for Long-Term, Adequate, and Sustainable Funding for the California State University (CSU)
Commendation for Assistant Vice Chancellor & Senior Strategist Dr. James T. Minor
Recommendation on the Pending Tentative Agreement Between the California State University (CSU) and the California Faculty Association (CFA)
Commendation for Assistant Vice Chancellor Sheila Thomas, Ed.D.

THE FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS WERE INTRODUCED FOR FIRST READING CONSIDERATION:

Request for the Review of the Fiscal Impact of any Proposed California Community College Baccalaureate Programs
Involving California State University (CSU) Faculty in the Approval Process for California Community College Four-year Baccalaureate Programs
Endorsement of the California State Student Association (CSSA) Resolution Calling for the CSU to Include Caste in Anti-Discriminatory Policy
CSU 2030 Challenges: Faculty Perspectives

ADJOURNMENT