AGENDA

COMMITTEE ON CAMPUS PLANNING, BUILDINGS AND GROUNDS

Meeting: **11:10 a.m., Wednesday, November 8, 2023**
Glenn S. Dumke Auditorium

Jack McGrory, Chair
Diana Aguilar-Cruz, Vice Chair
Larry L. Adamson
Raji Kaur Brar
Mark Ghilarducci
Leslie Gilbert-Lurie
Anna Ortiz-Morfit
Darlene Yee-Melichar

Consent

1. Approval of Minutes of the Meeting of September 12, 2023, *Action*

Discussion

2. California State University, Fresno Affordable Student Housing Schematic Design Approval, *Action*
3. San Diego State University, Imperial Valley - Brawley Sciences Building Project Schematic Design Approval, *Action*

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE COMMITTEE ON CAMPUS PLANNING, BUILDINGS AND GROUNDS

Trustees of the California State University
Office of the Chancellor
Glenn S. Dumke Auditorium
401 Golden Shore
Long Beach, California

September 12, 2023

Members Present

Jack McGrory, Chair
Diana Aguilar-Cruz, Vice Chair
Larry L. Adamson
Raji Kaur Brar
Mark Ghilarducci
Leslie Gilbert-Lurie

Wenda Fong, Chair of the Board
Jolene Koester, Interim Chancellor

Trustee Jack McGrory called the meeting to order.

Public Comment

Public comment occurred at the beginning of the meeting's open session prior to all committees. No public comments were made pertaining to committee agenda items.

Consent Agenda

The minutes of the July 2023 meeting of the Committee on Campus Planning, Buildings and Grounds were approved as submitted.

Following approval of the minutes, it was explained that the topics would be reordered to accommodate the schedule of a guest presenter for the California State University, Long Beach Hillside North Student Housing Schematic Design Approval presentation.

California State University, Long Beach Hillside North Student Housing Schematic Design Approval

This item requested approval of schematic plans for the California State University, Long Beach Hillside North Student Housing project.

During the presentation, Paul Gannoe, previously Chief of Planning and Design in Capital Planning Design and Construction, was introduced and congratulated on his promotion to Assistant Vice Chancellor, Capital Planning Design and Construction, upon the retirement of Vi San Juan.

Following the presentation, a question was asked about the value engineering approach which was undertaken for this project. It was explained that the builder, the architect, and the university collaborated on the process, and a second opinion was obtained from another builder. It was noted that site work is a high percentage of the cost, and it was explained that the water table on campus is high and special foundational elements are required. A question was asked about contingency costs, and it was explained that the estimate includes a 10% construction contingency and additional contingency for design. It was recommended that for future projects, a target cost per square foot should be established and architects should design to that target number. Additionally, it was suggested that the trustees be provided with an independent value engineering report so that project costs can be reviewed.

A question was asked about how this project will be funded, and it was explained that the funding plan for this project has changed over time. Due to financial challenges this year, the State took back approximately $1B for projects, but in exchange gave the CSU enough permanent base budget money to pay for debt service. The CSU views this as a preferred funding arrangement because the additional money is a permanent addition to the base budget. It was confirmed that the money allocated to this project does not compete with other projects for state money.

The project team was congratulated on value engineering efforts and reasonable project cost, but it was noted that the contingency element is high and should be managed closely.

The committee recommended approval of the proposed resolution (RCPBG 09-23-07).

Update and Approval of the Five-Year Capital Outlay Plan

This item requested approval by the California State University Board of Trustees of the Five-Year Capital Outlay Plan covering the period from 2024-2025 through 2028-2029.

Following the presentation, it was suggested that in addition to the six funding strategies that were outlined in the presentation, philanthropy should be added as a seventh strategy. It was noted that philanthropy has been becoming more important in recent years along with various combinations of funding approaches. The importance of funding capital projects was emphasized, to support the CSU's ability to increase enrollment in key programs and meet labor force needs. The need for a bond initiative was also noted.

It was asked why the proposed budget request for capital is only $1.3B when critical needs are actually $2.4B, and it was explained that the Chancellor's Office is trying to make an aggressive but realistic request. Concern was expressed that the lower request sends the wrong message and will not adequately address the growing capital needs of the CSU. It was explained that in addition to the budget request, the CSU's complete list of capital needs are continuously communicated with the Department of Finance and other governmental bodies.

The committee recommended approval of the proposed resolution (RCPBG 09-23-06).

California State University, San Bernardino Palm Desert Off-Campus Center Student Services Building Schematic Design Approval

This item requested approval of schematic plans for the Student Services Building project at the California State University, San Bernardino Palm Desert Off-Campus Center (Palm Desert Campus).

Following the presentation, it was noted that the estimated cost is $200 per square foot above the cost of comparable buildings, and it was asked what donors are willing to pledge for extra amenities. It was also reiterated that a value engineering report would be helpful to the trustees in analyzing project costs. It was explained that the proposed clock tower will not be built unless the university receives funding from the donor. It was also noted that the desert climate presents challenges, including a significant loss of productivity due to the heat in the summer months. It was reiterated that setting cost goals per square foot would be helpful. It was explained that for sites such as this which are not adjacent to utilities, costs will be higher than in urban settings.

It was noted that this building will present an opportunity, as there are not many buildings in the region to host high visibility events, and it also could create synergy with the community college. A question was asked about the difference between assignable square feet and gross square feet. It was explained that assignable square feet include offices and other primary purposes, whereas gross square feet include areas such as bathrooms, corridors, and stairwells.

It was noted that this project means a lot to the students and the community, but cost is still a concern, including the large percentage allocated for site work. The CSU's pool of money is limited, therefore project costs need to be closely scrutinized.

The committee recommended approval of the proposed resolution (RCPBG 09-23-08).

Trustee McGrory adjourned the Committee on Campus Planning, Buildings and Grounds.

COMMITTEE ON CAMPUS PLANNING, BUILDINGS AND GROUNDS

California State University, Fresno Affordable Student Housing Schematic Design Approval

Presentation By

Steve Relyea
Executive Vice Chancellor and
Chief Financial Officer

Deborah Adishian-Astone
Vice President for Administration and CFO
California State University, Fresno

Paul Gannoe
Assistant Vice Chancellor
Capital Planning, Design and Construction

Summary

This agenda item requests approval of schematic plans for the California State University, Fresno Affordable Student Housing project.

Affordable Student Housing
Project Architect: SVA Architects
Construction Manager at Risk Contractor: TBD

Background and Scope

California State University, Fresno (Fresno State) proposes to design and construct a four-story, 57,948 assignable square feet (ASF)/82,838 gross square feet (GSF) Affordable Student Housing building (#89[1]) on the existing Parking Lot 27, located at the southwest corner of the campus and west of Homan Hall (#88), an existing residence hall. This project was approved for funding in 2022-2023 through the State's Higher Education Student Housing Grant Program (HESHGP) to provide affordable student housing. As part of the 2023-24 state budget, the Higher Education Student Housing Grant will be replaced with CSU Systemwide Revenue Bonds supported by ongoing state appropriation. The Board of Trustees approved this funding swap in the July 2023 meeting. Fresno State will seek future Board of Trustees approval of Systemwide Revenue Bond financing for the self-support portion of the project funding. The grant program allows affordable beds to be located across the university inventory of new beds and the existing student housing inventory.

[1] The facility number is shown on the master plan map and recorded in the Space and Facilities Database.

Fresno State is a vibrant, diverse university community with approximately 24,000 students located in the central valley. The university is a federally designated Hispanic-Serving Institution, Asian American and Native American Pacific Islander-Serving Institution and is the driver of social mobility in the San Joaquin valley. The majority of students at Fresno State are low-income students. Fifty-two percent of Fresno State students are Pell-eligible; and 74% of undergraduate students are first-generation college students. Fresno State has not built new student housing since the late 1960s. The existing housing capacity of 1,121 beds can accommodate less than 5% of the student population with more than 250 students on the housing waitlist.

The university's vision is to provide access to affordable housing for all students that will improve graduation rates and support student success. This proposed project is aligned with the university's Strategic Plan vision of diversity, equity, and inclusive excellence, and will provide much needed affordable housing to designated low-income students, reducing the total cost of attendance, bolstering direct access to affordable student housing for those students in the most need, and improving student retention and graduation rates.

This project will construct 228 apartment style beds allowing the housing program to accommodate most of the students on the current waitlist. The first floor will provide a learning community, recreational spaces, and accessible housing units. The three upper residence floors are identical and include student housing units, shared study and gathering spaces, laundry facilities, and space for a resident advisor. Shared common spaces on each floor will foster student engagement and a sense of community. Outdoor hardscape and landscape areas will provide additional space for studying and recreation.

The new student housing building is a four-story load-bearing metal framed system supplemented by a concrete floor on a metal deck over structural metal steel joists. The overall massing creates a stepped roofline with the main entrance at the ground level. The proposed project is currently designed to meet the CSU's Sustainability Policy requirements. Notable sustainability features include low flow plumbing fixtures, high quality air filtration, maximum insulation values for walls and roofs, double-glazed windows, drought-tolerant landscaping, efficient irrigation systems, and groundwater recharge design elements.

Timing (Estimated)

Completion of Preliminary Drawings	January 2024
Completion of Working Drawings	May 2024
Start of Construction	October 2024
Occupancy	August 2026

Basic Statistics

Gross Building Area	82,838 square feet
Assignable Building Area (CSU[2])	57,948 square feet
Net Useable Building Area (FICM[3])	76,000 square feet
Efficiency (CSU)	70 percent
Efficiency (FICM)	92 percent

Cost Estimate—California Construction Cost Index 8287[4]

Building Cost ($500 per GSF)		$41,442,000
Systems Breakdown	*($ per GSF)*	
a. Substructure (Foundation)	$ 11.09	
b. Shell (Structure and Enclosure)	$ 134.30	
c. Interiors (Partitions and Finishes)	$ 115.73	
d. Services (HVAC, Plumbing, Electrical, Fire)	$ 159.67	
e. Built-in Equipment and Furnishings	$ 9.44	
f. Special Construction and Demolition	$ 0	
g. General Requirements/Conditions and Insurance	$ 70.05	
Site Development		$4,397,000
Construction Cost		$45,839,000
Fees, Contingency, Services		$11,054,000
Total Project Cost ($687 per GSF)		$56,893,000
Fixtures, Furniture & Movable Equipment		$1,857,000
Grand Total		$58,750,000

Cost Comparison

The student housing building's cost of $500 per GSF is lower than the $760 per GSF for the West Campus Green Student Housing and Health Center at San Francisco State University approved in January 2023, the $689 per GSF for the Affordable Student Housing Buildings #22 and #23 at

[2] Assignable building area is based on CSU policy.

[3] Net useable building area is greater than assignable building area by including corridors, restrooms, mechanical rooms, etc., based on the definitions of the Postsecondary Education Facilities Inventory & Classification Manual (FICM).

[4] The July 2022 Engineering News-Record California Construction Cost Index (CCCI). The CCCI is the average Building Cost Index for Los Angeles and San Francisco.

CSU Northridge approved in July 2022, the $551 per GSF for the Student Housing project at Cal Poly Humboldt approved in January 2023, the $580 per GSF for the University Village Housing and Dining project at CSU San Marcos approved in May 2023, and the $685 per GSF for the Hillside North Student Housing project at CSU Long Beach approved in September 2023, all adjusted to CCCI 8287.

During the value engineering process, Fresno State saved approximately $7 million in direct construction costs through several mindful revisions, including simplifying exterior design, reducing landscaping and site features, and choosing the most cost-effective mechanical systems, framing system, and finish materials. Sustainability elements included in the project that exceed code requirements, such as solar panels and highly efficient water conservation measures support the overall sustainability goals of California and the CSU and generate operating savings over the life of the facility.

Funding Data

This project was approved for funding ($31,050,000) in 2022-2023 from the State's Higher Education Student Housing Grant Program (HESHGP). As part of the 2023-24 state budget, the Higher Education Student Housing Grant will be replaced with CSU Systemwide Revenue Bonds supported by ongoing state appropriation. The Board of Trustees approved this funding realignment in the July 2023 meeting. This project will receive additional state-support CSU Systemwide Revenue Bonds ($2,700,000) from the 2023-24 state approved $7,489,000 to fund cost overruns associated with approved CSU affordable student housing project grants. In addition, this project will be co-funded with CSU Systemwide Revenue Bonds ($25,000,000) for self-support programs. The board will be asked at a future meeting to consider the approval of the CSU Systemwide Revenue Bond financing for the self-support portion of the project funding.

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Action

The proposed project is exempt under Categorical Exemption Class 32 of the Guidelines for Implementation of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) (Guidelines § 15132). This exemption applies to infill development projects that are consistent with applicable land use plans; on sites of no more than five acres, with no habitat value for sensitive species, that are substantially surrounded by urban uses and can be adequately served by public utilities and services; and that would not result in significant traffic, noise, air quality, or water quality impacts.

The project is subject to and incorporates applicable mitigation measures provided in the Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program adopted in conjunction with certification of the 1994 Campus Master Plan Environmental Impact Report (EIR) (State Clearinghouse No. 94032022). The applicable mitigation measures would be implemented during construction. Supporting documentation for the categorical exemption is available for review at: https://adminfinance.fresnostate.edu/facilitiesmanagement/projects/completedprojects.html

Recommendation

The following resolution is recommended for approval:

RESOLVED, By the Board of Trustees of the California State University, that:

1. The California State University, Fresno Affordable Student Housing project will benefit the California State University.

2. The California State University, Fresno Affordable Student Housing project qualifies for a categorical exemption from CEQA and a Notice of Exemption shall be filed following project approval (Guidelines § 15062(a)).

3. Applicable mitigation measures adopted in conjunction with Campus Master Plan approval and EIR certification in 1994 shall be implemented, monitored, and reported in accordance with the requirements of CEQA (Cal. Pub. Res. Code § 21081.6).

4. The schematic plans for the California State University, Fresno Affordable Student Housing project are approved at a project cost of $58,750,000 at CCCI 8287.

COMMITTEE ON CAMPUS PLANNING, BUILDINGS AND GROUNDS

San Diego State University, Imperial Valley - Brawley Sciences Building Project Schematic Design Approval

Presentation By

Steve Relyea
Executive Vice Chancellor and
Chief Financial Officer

Adela de la Torre
President
San Diego State University

Paul Gannoe
Assistant Vice Chancellor
Capital Planning, Design and Construction

Summary

This agenda item requests the California State University Board of Trustees approve schematic plans for the San Diego State University, Imperial Valley, Brawley Sciences Building project.

Project Background and Scope
Architect: AC Martin
Collaborative Design-Build Contractor: Sundt

The Brawley Sciences Building (#102[1]) is a new 22,500 assignable square feet (ASF)/36,900 gross square feet (GSF) teaching laboratory and research building on the SDSU Imperial Valley, Brawley campus. Imperial County's economic forecast projects a dramatic workforce and skill deficit that is facing the region and will continue to grow over the next ten years. This project will expand degree program offerings for students in the Imperial Valley region in the sciences and engineering fields and foster the local workforce to enhance their skills in the support of renewable and alternative energy production.

The project will serve 60 FTES in a combination of lower and upper division wet and dry teaching labs (6,300 ASF). The program also includes 7,500 ASF of flexible use wet and dry research labs, teaching and research lab support spaces, including graduate student workstations, 18 faculty/researcher offices, conference rooms, and informal collaboration spaces throughout the building. The building will include core facilities with major instruments and experimental fabrication space for collaborative work with industry partners.

[1] The facility number is shown on the master plan map and recorded in the Space and Facilities Database.

The project's exterior building massing will be constructed with a two-story tilt-up concrete structure composed of three volumes that are informed by solar exposure and prevailing wind directions. The shape of the building creates a three-sided courtyard leading to the main entrance, with a shaded colonnade providing a pathway from the existing Initial Building (#101). The concrete exterior walls are ideal to withstand the extreme climatic conditions of the Imperial Valley, and window openings are strategically placed in these walls to optimize indoor daylighting and transparency while keeping solar heat gain to a minimum. The building's taller volume to the north accommodates teaching and research labs, the shorter volume to the south houses faculty and advising offices, and a central double-height lobby space at the main entry connects the two wings.

The building will connect to existing domestic water, sanitary sewer, and telecommunications utility lines at the Brawley center. The building will utilize onsite bioretention basins for all storm drainage and runoff. A new electrical utility feed from the local utility company will service the building. Power will be provided from existing overhead lines along Highway 78 and then will run underground to a new transformer located in the new utility yard northeast of the building. The electrical system includes lighting, power, emergency power, fire alarm, and infrastructure for solar photovoltaics to be generated from future solar panels on the canopy. The building will take advantage of electrified air source heat pumps to provide energy efficient water heating. All space and water heating will be electrified, eliminating the need for natural gas.

The Brawley Sciences Building will achieve the sustainability goals of the university by pursuing active energy production strategies, as well as using architecture in a strategic way to mitigate solar heat gain and reduce operating energy loads. The project includes EV charging stations, infrastructure for future solar photovoltaics, runoff management, native landscaping, and efficient insulation and fixtures. This project will meet the requirements of the CSU Sustainability Policy.

Timing

Preliminary Plans Completed	December 2023
Working Drawings Completed	January 2024
Construction Start	January 2024
Occupancy	August 2025

Basic Statistics

Gross Building Area	36,900 square feet
Assignable Building Area (CSU[2])	22,500 square feet

[2] Assignable building area is based on CSU policy.

Net Useable Building Area (FICM[3])	35,100 square feet
Efficiency (CSU)	61 percent
Efficiency (FICM)	95 percent

Cost Estimate – California Construction Cost Index (CCCI) 8287[4]

Building Cost ($1,412 per GSF)		$52,089,000
Systems Breakdown	*($ per GSF)*	
a. Substructure (Foundation)	$ 38.56	
b. Shell (Structure and Enclosure)	$ 261.60	
c. Interiors (Partitions and Finishes)	$ 141.95	
d. Services (HVAC, Plumbing, Electrical, Fire)	$ 508.73	
e. Built-in Equipment and Furnishings	$ 123.01	
f. Special Construction & Demolition	$ 0.00	
g. General Requirements	$ 39.13	
h. General Conditions and Insurance	$ 298.64	
Site Development		$6,572,000
Construction Cost		$58,661,000
Fees, Contingency, Services		$19,339,000
Total Project Cost ($2,168 per GSF)		$78,000,000
Fixtures, Furniture & Movable Equipment		$2,000,000
Grand Total		$80,000,000

Cost Comparison

The building cost of $1,412 per GSF is higher than the CSU cost guide figure of $742 per GSF for a biological sciences (wet lab) building, the $947 per GSF for the Science Replacement Building at San Francisco State University approved in November 2020, and the $1,149 per GSF for the Interdisciplinary Science Building at San Jose State University approved in September 2018, all adjusted to CCCI 8287. Factors that contribute to the high building cost include: the remote location of the Brawley campus; the advanced technology lab environment, including heavy lab equipment required for industry collaboration; the extreme climatic conditions of the Imperial

[3] Net useable building area is greater than assignable building area by including corridors, restrooms, mechanical rooms, etc., based on the definitions of the Postsecondary Education Facilities Inventory & Classification Manual (FICM).

[4] The July 2022 *Engineering News-Record* California Construction Cost Index (CCCI). The CCCI is the average Building Cost Index for Los Angeles and San Francisco.

Valley requiring additional mechanical cooling to counteract the high loads of energy consumption in this lab intensive building; and the building's sustainable features such as heat recovery chillers for hot and cold water distribution and the use of electric energy only, as natural gas will only exist for lab use.

Funding Data

The project will be funded with $80,000,000 in state appropriations approved in the final 2022-2023 California State Budget.

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Action

An Initial Study/Mitigated Negative Declaration (IS/MND) tiering from analysis in the 2003 SDSU Imperial Valley Master Plan Project EIR was prepared to analyze the potential significant environmental effects of the proposed project in accordance with the requirements of CEQA and the CEQA Guidelines.

The IS/MND concluded that the project would result in potentially significant impacts on Biological Resources, Archaeological Resources, Paleontological Resources, and Tribal Cultural Resources. The IS/MND further determined the proposed project would result in less than significant impacts in the remaining environmental impact categories: Aesthetics, Agriculture and Forestry Resources, Air Quality, Cultural Resources (Historic Resources), Energy, Greenhouse Gas Emissions, Hazards and Hazardous Materials, Hydrology and Water Quality, Land Use and Planning, Mineral Resources, Noise, Population and Housing, Public Services, Recreation, Transportation, Utilities and Service Systems, and Wildfire.

The IS/MND was made available to the public for review and comment from September 5, 2023, to October 5, 2023. Four written comment letters were received by the close of the review period, from the California Department of Transportation (Caltrans) District 11, the Imperial County Air Pollution Control District (ICAPCD), the Imperial Irrigation District (IID), and the California Department of Fish and Wildlife (CDFW). Caltrans asked for clarification of the status of traffic improvements along SR-78 required by mitigation measures adopted in conjunction with the 2003 EIR, and the status of dedication by SDSU to Imperial County of right-of-way along the SR-78 for a right-turn lane into the Brawley Center driveway. The IAPCD questioned the project's compliance with its rules and regulations and the thresholds of significance used to determine air quality impacts. The IID noted the need for new electrical and, potentially, water, sewer, and stormwater infrastructure to serve the project and requested coordination with SDSU regarding any necessary rights-of-way and easements. CDFW questioned whether a comprehensive biological resources assessment had been performed addressing sensitive species potentially affected by the project, and suggested clarifications and minor revisions to IS/MND mitigation measures. Public comments have been reviewed and considered and did not raise substantive new issues not already addressed in the IS/MND or resulted in the need for substantive revisions. Responses to all comments are provided in the finalized IS/MND.

Mitigation measures incorporated into the IS/MND as conditions of project approval, together with mitigation measures in the Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program adopted in conjunction with the 2003 EIR, reduce all potentially significant project impacts to a less than significant level. Each of the mitigation measures is listed in, and will be implemented through, the Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program prepared pursuant to Public Resources Code Section 21081.6 and CEQA Guidelines Section 15097, for adoption pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15074(d).

Accordingly, there is no substantial evidence, considering the whole record, that the Brawley Sciences Building project may have a significant effect on the environment. This finding is supported by the IS/MND and all related materials, in compliance with CEQA Guidelines Section 15070. The IS/MND and related materials are available for review by the Board and the public at: https://bfa.sdsu.edu/campus/facilities/planning/eir.

Recommendation

The following resolution is presented for approval:

RESOLVED, by the Board of Trustees of the California State University, that:

1. The IS/MND was prepared to evaluate the environmental effects of the Brawley Sciences Building project and confirms that the project will not result in new significant impacts that cannot be mitigated, pursuant to the requirements of CEQA (Public Resources Code Section 21000 et seq.) and the CEQA Guidelines. The IS/MND is consistent with the assumptions in and is properly tiered from, the 2003 SDSU Imperial Valley Master Plan Project EIR and has been completed in compliance with CEQA (Public Resources Code 20180(d) and (e)) and the CEQA Guidelines Section 15074.

2. This resolution is adopted pursuant to the requirements of Public Resources Code Section 21081 and CEQA Guidelines Section 15091, which require that the Board of Trustees make findings regarding significant project effects prior to the approval of a project.

3. The Board of Trustees finds that the IS/MND reflects its independent judgment and analysis and hereby adopts the IS/MND, approves the project, and reaffirms prior adoption of the Findings of Fact and Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program prepared for the 2003 SDSU Imperial Valley Master Plan Project EIR.

4. Mitigation measures contained within the 2003 SDSU Imperial Valley Master Plan Project EIR Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program that are applicable to the Brawley Sciences Building project are hereby incorporated by reference and shall be monitored and reported in accordance with the requirements of CEQA (Public Resources Code Section 21081.6).

5. The Brawley Sciences Building project will benefit the California State University.

6. The schematic plans for the Brawley Sciences Building project are approved at a project cost of $80,000,000 at CCCI 8287.