Module V

Selecting Exemplars and Writing Commentary on Student Work

Module Outcome

Participants will identify an exemplar paper for each performance level and write commentary for each paper selected

Content Overview

A. Present the model “Exemplars with Commentary”
B. Present the “Criteria for Exemplars with Commentary”
C. Select student work from the Bowling Task
D. Debrief the process

Materials

- Handout #26: Sample Exemplar with Commentary
- Handout #27: Criteria for Exemplars with Commentary
V.A Exemplars with Commentary

1) Present the model “Sample Exemplar with Commentary” pointing out the features:
   • The paper was selected as an exemplar for this level because it provides clear and sufficient evidence of the characteristics of the performance level
   • The evidence is marked in the student work
   • The descriptions of the evidence are aligned with the performance level description in the scoring guide
Sample Exemplar with Commentary – Mathematics

A. Refers to Dave having a higher average, but does not show computation or results of computation for either bowler.

B. Displays graphs with one axis unlabeled. Text states that Dave is consistent in his scoring, but student does not connect the graph to interpretation of consistency. The student does not explain the difference in range between the two bowlers using specific numbers.
Sample Exemplar with Commentary – English

A. Addresses Bill’s concern that he won’t be bowling with the team by apologizing and by stating that the decision is not about his ability.

B. Attempts to justify choice, but instead of using mathematical data as justification, the student makes up a reason for not selecting Bill (i.e., not enough room) skirting the issue of performance altogether.

C. Again the student addresses concern for Bill, this time using words of encouragement for the future.

D. Overall, the letter focuses more on concern for Bill not being selected rather than using any mathematical evidence to support the selection of Dave.
V.B Criteria for Exemplars with Commentary

1) Present the “Criteria for Exemplars with Commentary”

A. Selects a sample of student work for each performance level that exemplifies the level of quality described in the scoring guide.

B. Cites sufficient and appropriate evidence to support the given performance level in the scoring guide.

- Notes the specific ways in which the work meets the performance standard
- Notes the specific ways in which the work does not yet meet the performance standard
- Describes what needs to be changed to meet the performance standard
Criteria for Exemplars with Commentary

A. Selects a sample of student work for each performance level that exemplifies the level of quality described in the scoring guide.

B. Cites sufficient and appropriate evidence to support the given performance level in the scoring guide.

- Notes the specific ways in which the work meets the performance standard

- Notes the specific ways in which the work does not yet meet the performance standard

- Describes what needs to be done to meet the performance standard
V.C Select Student Work from the Bowling Task

1) Provide participants with time to select a piece of student work from the Bowling Task for a particular performance level.

2) Have participants analyze the student work and write commentary that provides sufficient and appropriate evidence to support the given performance level.
V.D Debrief Process

1) Debrief this process, allowing participants to share their written comments. Use the Criteria for Exemplars with Commentary as a guide for providing feedback. Point out where participants used the criteria successfully and when they did not. Demonstrate ways to improve the participants’ commentary where necessary. Identify strengths of the participants’ commentary, especially when it is a good example of the criteria. Use the whole group conversation to clarify participants understanding of the criteria, as necessary, so they can replicate this process with their own student work.