Replenishing Opportunity in America

José L. Cruz
Vice President for Higher Ed Policy & Practice
jcruz@edtrust.org
Give Students a Compass
American Association of Colleges & Universities | California State University
Difficult and Uncertain Times
Increased demand for solutions
INACTION IS NOT AN OPTION
The Land of Opportunity
Regardless of the circumstances you are born into, if you work hard you can become anything you want.
Generational Advancement

Through saving and hard work, each generation of parents can secure a better education—and a better future—for their children.
Powerful Narratives

No longer true
Wealthiest 20% Earn Half of All Income

Poorest 20% earn almost none of the income
Earnings Among the Lowest Income Families have Declined

Percent Growth Mean Family Income: Constant Dollars, 1980-2010

Source: The College Board, “Trends in College Pricing 2011” (New York: College Board, 2010), Figure 16A.
US has Higher Income Inequality than Most G8 Nations

Gini Coefficient: 0 = total income equality, 1 = total income inequality

US has Higher Income Inequality than Most OECD Nations

Gini Coefficient: 0 = total income equality, 1 = total income inequality

Tunisia, Sri Lanka, and Morocco... countries with the same level of inequality as the United States
US has One of Lowest Rates of Intergenerational Mobility

Cross-country examples of the link between father and son wages

Nepal and Pakistan...
Countries with the same level of intergenerational mobility as the United States

The Color of Inequality
Median Net Worth of Households in 2009 dollars

Reduction in Median Net Worth of Households

2009 vs. 2005, in 2009 dollars

Steep Climb

Percentage starting in the lowest income quintile of income and stay there

Education - The Great Equalizer

Four years of college eliminates gaps in mobility between whites and blacks

So, How are We Doing?

College going | College access | College success | Educational attainment
We’ve made a lot of progress on the access side over the past 30 years.

Immediate College-going is Up for All Students

We’ve made a lot of progress on the access side over the past 30 years.

College-going is Up for All Racial and Ethnic Groups
College-going is Increasing for All Income Groups
Access Gaps Persist

Between whites and underrepresented minority groups
Low-Income Students Going to College

2009

High-Income Students Going to College

1972

For-Profit College Companies

13% of enrollments
24% of federal financial aid
48% of loan defaults

Access to What?
1/5 of black and Hispanic students start at a for-profit

Gaps in Student Success are not any Better

African American and Latino freshmen complete 4-year degrees at lower rates.

Success Rates at 2-year Colleges are Low for All

Net Result?
25-29 Year Olds with B.A. or Higher

2010

B.A. Rate by Age 24

2009

Source: Postsecondary Education Opportunity, "Bachelor’s Degree Attainment by Age 24 by Family Income Quartiles, 1970 to 2009."
Differentiated Value of Degrees

Lifetime Earnings in 2009 dollars

For African Americans and Latinos, there are large gaps between earnings when compared to Whites, especially at the lowest levels of educational attainment. It should be noted that these gaps would be larger if the full-time, full-year approach was expanded to include periods when workers were out of the labor force. While the gaps are smallest at the some college/no degree, Associate's, Master's, and Doctoral degree levels, they are large again among Bachelor's and Professional degree holders. These patterns suggest that more study is needed regarding the nature of occupational concentration by race/ethnicity at the high and low ends of the occupational ladder.

At the highest levels of educational attainment, African Americans and Latinos lag far behind the earnings of their White and Asian counterparts—over a lifetime, they make close to a million dollars less.

African Americans with Bachelor's degrees make 20% less than Whites with Bachelor's degrees.

Inequality Threatens Democracy

Civic engagement | Mental health | Life expectancy | Critical consumption of info
Some groups are growing more than others

Closing Achievement Gaps is Key

Some groups are growing more than others
We’re still Relatively Strong in Educational Attainment

Percentage of Adults Ages 25-64 with a College Degree

Our World Standing is Weaker for Younger Workers
Percentage of Adults Ages 25-34 with a College Degree
We’re Near the Bottom in Intergenerational Progress

Difference in % of Adults with a College Degree: Ages 25-34 vs. 45-54

Clear and Urgent Need to Reverse Dangerous Trends

...and to do so, we need to mind the gaps
We Must Level the Playing Field
DEMAND BETTER SCHOOLS
National Inequities in State and Local Revenue Per Student

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Districts</th>
<th>Funding Gap</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High vs. Low Poverty</td>
<td>$773 per student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High vs. Low Minority</td>
<td>$1,122 per student</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Education Trust analyses based on U.S. Dept of Education and U.S. Census Bureau data for 2005-06

Low-Income and Minority Students... continue to be clustered in schools where we spend less
Students in Poor Schools Receive ‘A’s for Work That Would Earn ‘Cs’ in Affluent Schools

Low-Income and Minority students... continue to be clustered in schools where we expect less

African American, Latino, Native American H.S. Grads Less Likely to Have Been Enrolled in Full College Prep Track

Low-Income and Minority students...
continue to be clustered in schools where we teach them less
Core classes in high-poverty and high-minority secondary schools are more likely to be taught by out-of-field teachers.

Low-Income and Minority students continue to be clustered in schools where we assign them our least qualified teachers.
While We’re Making Some Progress in Addressing these Problems in Elementary and Middle Schools…
4th Grade Reading

Record performance with gap narrowing
4th Grade Math

Record performance with gap narrowing
8th Grade Math

Progress for all groups, some gap narrowing

Source: NAEP 2008 Trends in Academic Progress, NCES
We have not yet Turned the Corner in our High Schools.
17 Year Olds Overall - NAEP

Achievement Flat in Reading

17 year-olds overall NAEP
Achievement Flat in Math

17 year-olds overall NAEP
12th Grade Reading

No progress, gaps wider than in 1988

Source: NAEP 2008 Trends in Academic Progress, NCES
17 Year Olds - NAEP Math

*Denotes previous assessment format

Source: NAEP 2008 Trends in Academic Progress, NCES

12th Grade Math

Results mostly flat, gaps same or widening
Of every 100 Kindergarteners...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attainment</th>
<th>White</th>
<th>African American</th>
<th>Latino</th>
<th>Native American</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HS/GED</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some College</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor’s</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Unsustainable Trends
OPPOSE MISGUIDED FINANCIAL AID POLICIES
Federal Pell Grants

...have failed to keep pace with rising college costs

Yet, while many in Washington are claiming that the estimated $33B spent on the Pell Grant program in 2010 is “unsustainable”...
The Unsustainable Pell

"So you can go to college on Pell Grants—maybe I should not be telling anybody this because it’s turning out to be the welfare of the 21st century." - Rep. Rehberg, 4/1/11
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tax Break</th>
<th>2010 Expenditures</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lifetime Learning Credit</td>
<td>$3.5 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Opportunity Tax Credit</td>
<td>$15.1 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deduction for higher education expenses</td>
<td>$0.8 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>$19.4 billion</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


$19.4 Billion was Spent on College Tax Breaks
...that primarily benefit middle and upper-income families
Higher education tax benefits for families making more than $100,000 cost more than $5.1 billion, and could fund more than 900,000 maximum Pell Grants.

Exclusion of interest on bonds for private nonprofit educational facilities costs more than $2.4 billion, and could fund more than 400,000 maximum Pell Grants.

More than 1.3 million maximum Pell Grants

Note: Annual Cost for higher education tax benefits is for calendar year 2011; for exclusion of interest on bonds for private nonprofit education it is fiscal year 2011.

At the same time, states also have diverted grant funds away from low-income students.
Non-need-based aid grew at 4.7x the rate of need-based aid.

State spending on grant aid, millions of dollars:

1993–94:
- Need-based: $2,216
- Non-need-based: $245

2009–10:
- Need-based: $6,338
- Non-need-based: $2,393

Change in Distribution of State Grants Based on Need

Source: NASSGAP 34th and 40th Annual Survey Report on State Sponsored Student Financial Aid
The Inalienable Right to HOPE-Mobiles

“Another idea is to work economic need into the equation, though that idea does not have much support, both lawmakers and educators said.” - The New York Times, Jan. 6, 2011
Colleges and universities also make inequitable choices with their grant funds

Four-Year Colleges Have Increased Grant Aid

But most of the increases have gone to high-income students

Institutions Behaving Inequitably: $15 billion in 2007

Public institutions spend the same amount of grant funds on high-income as on low-income students. Private institutions spend twice as much on high-income students.

The result?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Family Income</th>
<th>Average Income</th>
<th>Cost of Attendance</th>
<th>Expected Family Contribution (EFC)</th>
<th>Average Grant Aid</th>
<th>Unmet Need After EFC and Grant Aid</th>
<th>% of Income Required to Pay for College After Grant Aid</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$0-30,200</td>
<td>$17,011</td>
<td>$22,007</td>
<td>$951</td>
<td>$9,704</td>
<td>$11,352</td>
<td>72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$30,201-54,000</td>
<td>$42,661</td>
<td>$23,229</td>
<td>$4,043</td>
<td>$7,694</td>
<td>$11,493</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$54,001-80,400</td>
<td>$67,844</td>
<td>$23,640</td>
<td>$10,224</td>
<td>$5,352</td>
<td>$8,064</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$80,401-115,400</td>
<td>$97,594</td>
<td>$25,050</td>
<td>$18,158</td>
<td>$4,554</td>
<td>$2,339</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$115,401+</td>
<td>$173,474</td>
<td>$27,689</td>
<td>$37,821</td>
<td>$3,822</td>
<td>-$13,953</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


**Low-Income Students Must Devote an Amount Equivalent...**

...to **72%** of their family income toward college costs.
Only 65 Institutions...

have net price below 27% of family income for low-income students
EXAMINE SUCCESSFUL INSTITUTIONS
We are doing as well as we can given the students we serve...

What We Hear
from college communities across the country
Grad rates vary widely across postsecondary institutions

4Y Avg: 36% | 6Y Avg: 57% | Graduation from ANY Institution: ~67%

Source: Ed Trust Analysis of College Results Online Dataset 2008
Examining the differences

70% of differences can be explained away - but what institutions do matters

www.collegeresults.org
IPEDS Doesn’t Tell the Whole Story
But Tells Us how well we are doing with the easiest students
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>University</th>
<th>Median SAT</th>
<th>Size</th>
<th>% Pell</th>
<th>% URM</th>
<th>Overall Grad Rate</th>
<th>URM Grad Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Florida State University</td>
<td>1,1160</td>
<td>28,874</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>68.7%</td>
<td>69.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Arizona</td>
<td>1,110</td>
<td>25,867</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Ed Trust Analysis of College Results Online Dataset 2008

Research Universities
Similar students, different results
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>University</th>
<th>Median SAT</th>
<th>Size</th>
<th>% Pell</th>
<th>Overall Grad Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University of Northern Iowa</td>
<td>1,085</td>
<td>9,946</td>
<td>23.8%</td>
<td>65.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montclair State</td>
<td>1,015</td>
<td>10,908</td>
<td>26.5%</td>
<td>61.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eastern Illinois</td>
<td>1,010</td>
<td>9,798</td>
<td>23.7%</td>
<td>60.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UW - White Water</td>
<td>1,030</td>
<td>8,690</td>
<td>20.3%</td>
<td>53.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tennessee Tech. University</td>
<td>1,045</td>
<td>7,014</td>
<td>29.8%</td>
<td>43.5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Ed Trust Analysis of College Results Online Dataset 2008

Master’s Universities
Similar students, different results
## Historically Black Colleges and Universities

### Similar students, different results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Median SAT</th>
<th>Size</th>
<th>% Pell</th>
<th>Overall Grad Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Elizabeth City</td>
<td>845</td>
<td>2,423</td>
<td>69.9%</td>
<td>50.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delaware State</td>
<td>835</td>
<td>3,057</td>
<td>47.8%</td>
<td>37.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U of Arkansas Pine Bluff</td>
<td>775</td>
<td>2,768</td>
<td>73.5%</td>
<td>32.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norfolk State</td>
<td>900</td>
<td>4,798</td>
<td>54.5%</td>
<td>30.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coppin State</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>2,800</td>
<td>72.6%</td>
<td>18.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Ed Trust Analysis of College Results Online Dataset 2008
Bottom Line

We are all responsible and we can all do better
EMBRACE THE CHALLENGE
Above National Average in Proportion of Bachelor’s Degrees

Adults Ages 25-64 with at least a BA Degree, 2009
Above National Average in Proportion of Associate’s Degrees

Adults Ages 25-64 with at least an AA Degree, 2009

Source: 2009 American Community Survey data from NCHEMS Information Center http://www.higheredinfo.org/dbrowser/?level=nation&mode=data&state=0&submeasure=244
Above National Average Gap Between Whites and Minorities

Percent of Adults 25-64 with at Least a BA Degree, 2007
Above National Average Gap Between Whites and Minorities

Percent of Adults 25-64 with at Least a AA Degree, 2007

Below National Average in Proportion of Bachelor’s Degrees

Adults Ages 25-34 with at least a BA Degree, 2009
Below National Average in Proportion of Associate’s Degrees

Adults Ages 25-34 with at least an AA Degree, 2009
### Above National Average in College-going Rates

**College continuation rate for recent high school graduates, 2008**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>California</td>
<td>65.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>63.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mississippi</td>
<td>64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louisiana</td>
<td>65.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Massachusetts</td>
<td>64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Jersey</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Dakota</td>
<td>61%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>61%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Carolina</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virginia</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connecticut</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minnesota</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nevada</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Texas</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arizona</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hawaii</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colorado</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Carolina</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Mexico</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Hampshire</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ohio</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pennsylvania</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wyoming</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idaho</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utah</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illinois</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oklahoma</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oregon</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montana</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Washington</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idaho</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alaska</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Postsecondary Education Opportunity, "Chance for College by Age 19 by State, 1986-2008"
College-going Matches National Average when Dropouts Considered

HS Grad Rate x College Continuation Rate, 2008

Source: Postsecondary Education Opportunity, "Chance for College by Age 19 by State, 1986-2008"
Enrolling More Underrepresented Minority Students

But transfers have decreased
Enrolling More Low-Income Students

But transfers have decreased
Awarding More Degrees to Underrepresented Minorities

Number of bachelor’s degrees conferred, 2005-06 and 2009-10
Awarding More Degrees to Low-Income Students

Number of bachelor’s degrees conferred, 2005-06 and 2009-10

Source: The Education Trust, Access to Success.
Access Gaps for Minority Students Are Narrowing

Bachelor’s seekers - entering students 2009-10

Gap: 3 points
Entrants, % URM: 46
HS Grads, % URM: 49

Gap: 12 points
Entrants, % URM: 40
HS Grads, % URM: 52

Source: The Education Trust, Access to Success.
Access Gaps for Low-Income Students Have Closed

Bachelor’s seekers - entering students 2009-10

Source: The Education Trust, Access to Success.
Success Rates are Up for Minority Students

Six-year success rates for bachelor’s students over time

Source: The Education Trust, Access to Success.
Success Rates are Up for Low-Income Students

Six-year success rates for bachelor’s students over time
Success Gaps Remain Stagnant for Minorities

2010 six-year graduation rates for 2004 cohort
Success Gaps Remain Stagnant for Low-Income Students

2010 six-year graduation rates for 2004 cohort

Source: The Education Trust, Access to Success.
Success Rates are Up and Gaps Down on Many Campuses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Campus</th>
<th>Gaps</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>San Diego State University</td>
<td>↓11 points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>San Francisco State University</td>
<td>↓7 points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSU-Bakersfield</td>
<td>↓7 points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSU-Sacramento</td>
<td>↓6 points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>California Polytechnic State University - San Luis Obispo</td>
<td>↓5 points</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: The Education Trust, Access to Success.
61% of total loss occurs during first 2 years

The Importance of the First 2 Years - URM Freshmen

2010 six-year graduation and retention rates for 2004 cohort
57% of total loss occurs during first 2 years

The Importance of the First 2 Years - Pell Freshmen

2010 six-year graduation and retention rates for 2004 cohort

Source: The Education Trust, Access to Success.
BE INTENTIONAL
ACCESS TO SUCCESS

Colorado State University | Connecticut State University System | Kentucky Council of Postsecondary Education | Minnesota State Colleges and Universities | Mississippi Institutions of Higher Learning | Montana University System | Pennsylvania State System of Higher Education | Rhode Island Board of Governors for Higher Education | South Dakota Board of Regents | State University of New York | State University System of Florida | Tennessee Board of Regents | The California State University System | The City University of New York | University of Hawaii System | University of Louisiana System | University of Missouri System | University of North Carolina System | University of Texas System | University of Wisconsin System | University System of Maryland | Louisiana Board of Regents

22 Systems, 312 Campuses, 3.5 Million Students

893,000 Underrepresented Minorities | 976,000 Pell Recipients
2015 Goals

Increase number of degrees | Cut access and success gaps in half
Welcome to the CSU Graduation Initiative

The CSU Graduation Initiative strives to raise the freshman six-year graduation rate by eight percentage points by 2015-2016, and cut in half the existing gap in degree attainment by CSU's under-represented minority (URM) students. Involving all 23 CSU campuses, the Graduation Initiative encourages campuses to establish graduation targets comparable to the top quartile of national averages of similar institutions, and to close the URM achievement gap through a series of carefully planned activities.

As a system, the CSU graduates just over 50% of its students in six years. Every interrupted education is a lost opportunity for the student, the student's family and community, and the state. We face a moral imperative to serve our students better by helping more of them complete the college educations that prepare them for full and productive lives. The Graduation Initiative commits us to systematically discovering and disclosing the roadblocks to our students' success, now and for the rest of their lives.

Campus Practices

The CSU Graduation Initiative: Campus Pros

Engaged Learning Workshops
December 1-2, 2011
Presentations from Vincent Tinto and George Sanchez demonstrating the importance of fostering engaging learning opportunities in the classroom.

Moving Beyond Access: Increasing Student Persistence
(PPT 266 KB)

High-Impact and Broad Reach
(PPTX 279 KB)
Progress Cutting Access Gaps

~60% systems
Progress Closing Success Gaps


~30% systems
Success in Motion

Number of URM students | URM grad rate | URM success gap
San Diego State University

Raising grad rates and cutting URM gaps
Towson University

Large gains in URM and Pell grad rates nearly close gaps

Change in six-year graduation rates for first-time bachelor’s students from 2005-2009
High Impact Practices

Focus not only on the what, but the how... from best practices to better practitioners
PRIVILEGE QUALITY OVER BOLDNESS
Understand that Quality of Execution Trumps Boldness of Reform

Transformation = sum of many well-choreographed, incremental reforms
Clear Goals and Visible Leaders

System and institutional champions | Loosely coupled guiding coalitions
Tap into Institutional Culture

Color within the lines drawn by decades of shared governance
Communicate the What and the Why – Not the How

Treat faculty and support personnel as problem-solvers, not problems
Leverage Routines and Respect Rhythms

Leverage institutional routines and respect the rhythms of deliberative processes
5
Make Data Come Alive – Make Data Pervasive

Relevant | Contextualized | Timely | Actionable
BUILD A MOVEMENT
Leadership Lessons from Dancing Guy
Replicate and Validate Equity-Minded Policies and Practices
One Final Thought

Never has it been more likely in the US that if you’re born poor, you’ll die poor.
Stakes are Extremely High

Opportunity deficits should weigh as much on our minds as the budget deficits we seek to tame.
Higher Education Can’t Do It All

But we have far more power than we have used to date.
A New Day
Expand access | Align with success | Replenish opportunity
WWW.EDTRUST.ORG

Closing the gaps in opportunity and achievement, pre-K through college

José L. Cruz
Vice President for Higher Education Policy and Practice
jcruz@edtrust.org